Oxfam France, ONE, Sherpa and Le Basic reply to Total, May 22nd 2017

French - https://www.oxfamfrance.org/sites/default/files/reponse_doxfam_a_total.pdf

Following Total's response to our report "Transparency in its raw state: interpreting the transparency disclosures of extractive companies," Oxfam, ONE & Sherpa wish to clarify the following points:

- Without providing any additional data that could support or disprove any of the
 hypothesis made in the report, Total's response confirms that there is a \$100 million
 gap between the revenues disclosed by the Angolan authorities and the payments made
 by based on Total's disclosures. The information Total provides in their response does
 not sufficiently address the questions in the report. Without further information from
 Total we remain unable to provide a definitive assertion as to why this gap exists.
- During a meeting on January 13th 2017 between Total and the authors of the report –
 the meeting mentioned by Total in its response the company did not answer all of our
 questions. Primarily, Total declined to disclose the number of barrels associated with
 the profit oil in kind payments for Block 17 in Angola the subject of the case study. The
 lack of transparency in the interactions between Total and Angola was and continues to
 be our motivation for carrying out this case study.
- During a phone conversation between Total and the authors of the report held on May 12, 2017 (after the report was published), we asked Total for information on the number of barrels associated with in kind payments and the methodology used to determine barrel prices. Making this information publicly available is a requirement under the EU Accounting and Transparency directives but this aspect of the law has not been fully implemented in France. Such additional information could be used to support or disprove the hypothesis put forward in the report. To date, Total refuses to make this information public despite the fact that several other French companies do. Doing this would be the easiest way for Total to dispel doubt around its activities in Angola. We remain open to discussing these issues with Total in the future.
- We reiterate our recommendation that the French government reviews "the gaps in its implementation of the EU Accounting and Transparency directives revealed by our analysis [...] and include in its implementation of the directives a provision for companies to disclose payments in kind both in value and in volume as specified in the EU directives". Our case study provides sufficient evidence as to why this provision needs to be fully implemented.