ACCOUNTABILITY THROUGH ACTIVE CITIZENSHIP: IMPROVING PETROLEUM GOVERNANCE IN GHANA, MOZAMBIQUE & TANZANIA

BASELINE SURVEY REPORT - MOZAMBIQUE

Chiqui Arregui
January 2015
As part of our commitment to accountability and learning, Oxfam will share conclusions and recommendations from baseline reports. Internally we will share with relevant stakeholders, ensuring that they have an opportunity to participate in discussion of those results in meaningful ways. We will also publish the evaluation reports on our website in accessible language.

As a rights-based organization, accountability, particularly to the communities we seek to serve, is of the highest importance to us. For Oxfam, accountability requires Oxfam to regularly and honestly assess the quality of its work, share and learn from its findings with primary stakeholders, and apply that learning in future work.

This is a baseline study for Oxfam America’s Program Accountability through Active Citizenship: Improving Petroleum Governance in Ghana, Mozambique and Tanzania. The program has been operating in Ghana, Mozambique and Tanzania since July 2014.

The major activities for producing this report took place in November and December 2014. The study was carried out by Chiqui Arregui through a competitive process and reflects the findings as reported by them as validated with stakeholders. The study was managed by Katie Martorana, Program Officer from Oxfam America, and commissioned by Keith Slack, Extractive Industries Global Program Manager, Programs Department.

For additional information regarding the study Terms Of Reference, please refer to the report appendices.
CONTENTS

Abbreviations and Acronyms 4

Acknowledgements ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.

Executive Summary ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.

1. Introduction ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.

2. Methodology 14

3. Findings
   3.1 Outcome 1 16
   3.2 Outcome 2 23
   3.3 Outcome 3 31
   3.4 Other Key Interventions around Accountability in Extractives 32

Annexes
Annex 1: Bibliographic References 36
Annex 2: Institutions and People Interviewed 39
Annex 3: Non-statistical Quantifiers 41
Annex 4: Summary of Findings 43
Annex 5: CEIDA Review Letter 47

List of Tables
Table 1: Indicators Developed for the Baseline in Mozambique, per Program Outcome 11
Table 2: Baseline Interviewees by Stakeholder type, in Mozambique 14
Table 3: Summary of Community Capacity Building Needs in the Context of O&G Projects 17
Table 4: Summary of Studies and Analyses Carried Out by Organizations Based in Mozambique Around O&G Issues in Recent Years 21

List of Figures
Figure 1: Grassroots-based Advocacy and Community Participation in Local Governance Structure Proposed by CCM 33
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ASPACADE</td>
<td>Associação de Paralegais de Cabo Delgado</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCM</td>
<td>Conselho Cristão de Moçambique</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEIDA</td>
<td>Corporate Social Responsibilities of Extractive Industries in Developing Areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFJJ</td>
<td>Centro de Formação Jurídica e Judiciária / Mozambican Judicial and Judiciary Training Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIP</td>
<td>Centro de Integridade Pública</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSO</td>
<td>Civil Society Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSR</td>
<td>Corporate Social Responsibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTV</td>
<td>Centro Terra Viva</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPFPD</td>
<td>Direcção Provincial de Finanças, Plano e Desenvolvimento / Provincial Directorate for Finances, Development and Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DUAT</td>
<td>Direito de Uso e Aproveitamento da Terra / Right of Use and Benefit of the Land</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECOSOC</td>
<td>(United Nations) Economic and Social Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EI</td>
<td>Extractive Industries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EITI</td>
<td>Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPCC</td>
<td>Exploration and Production Concession Contract</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESIA</td>
<td>Environmental and Social Impact Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESMP</td>
<td>Environmental and Social Management Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAO</td>
<td>(United Nations) Food and Agriculture Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FID</td>
<td>Final Investment Decision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FOCACADE</td>
<td>Foro de Organizações de Cabo Delgado</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FPIC</td>
<td>Free, Prior and Informed Consent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT</td>
<td>Information and Communication Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IFAD</td>
<td>International Fund for Agricultural Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IFC</td>
<td>International Finance Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPAJ</td>
<td>Instituto de Patrocínio e Apoio Jurídico / Institute for Sponsorship and Provision of Legal Support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITC</td>
<td>Iniciativa de Terras Comunitárias</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IUCN</td>
<td>International Union for the Conservation of Nature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LNG</td>
<td>Liquefied Natural Gas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MICOA</td>
<td>Ministério para a Coordenação da Acção Ambiental / Ministry for the Coordination of Environmental Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIREM</td>
<td>Ministério de Recursos Minerais / Ministry for Mineral Resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MPD</td>
<td>Ministério de Plano e Desenvolvimento / Ministry of Planning and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non Governmental Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NORAD</td>
<td>Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OHCHR</td>
<td>Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O&amp;G</td>
<td>Oil and Gas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PNSCRNIE</td>
<td>Plataforma Nacional da Sociedade Civil de Recursos Naturais e Indústria Extrativa / National Civil Society Platform on Natural Resources and Extractive Industries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SESA</td>
<td>Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNAC</td>
<td>União Nacional dos Camponeses / National (Smallholder) Farmers Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WLSA</td>
<td>Women and Law in Southern Africa (in Mozambique)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WWF</td>
<td>The World Wildlife Fund for Nature</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The consultant would like to express her sincere appreciation to a number of individuals who facilitated the conduction of this study. First and foremost Hélder Paulo, Oxfam Mozambique Program Officer for Extractives for having tirelessly reached out to relevant stakeholders and ensuring the consultant's period of visit was as efficient and effective as possible, flexible and pleasurable. To Renaud Leray, Oxfam Mozambique’s Country Director a word of appreciation for the well-rounded introduction to Oxfam Mozambique’s program and goals. Thanks also go out to the efficient and clear guidance provided by Katie Martorana, Oxfam America Program Officer, who allowed for proper and flexible alignment and adjustment of international, national and local impact assessment tools.

In addition, I would like to thank all government officials, civil society organization representatives, journalists, donors and paralegals that granted their time, knowledge and experience to participate in this baseline study. They provided the essential information to better understand the challenges faced by communities, oil and gas companies and government institutions in a young yet rapidly evolving context. The findings of this baseline study reinforce the need and desire for a level playing field; and that effective information sharing, capacity building and participation can contribute towards productive dialogue, accountability and transparency, and – ultimately - sustainable O&G and socio-economic development.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The NORAD-funded *Accountability through Active Citizenship Program: Improving Petroleum Governance in Ghana, Mozambique and Tanzania* aims to contribute towards an active society that promotes responsible management of Oil and Gas (O&G) resources for sustainable development and poverty reduction, based on transparency, accountability and safeguarding the needs of future generations. In Mozambique, the program seeks to enable the active and informed participation of communities, Civil Society Organizations (CSO) and the media. As such, it will contribute to redressing the power imbalances resulting from unequal access to information, poor awareness of governance and decision-making processes and rights, as well as the structural weaknesses in the media sector limiting its participation in O&G reporting. The program has a strong gender component focusing on increasing awareness on and avoiding common impacts of Extractive Industry (EI) projects on women, increasing women’s participation in governance processes and promoting gender sensitive poverty alleviation.

From a geographical perspective, the program focuses in Palma District, Cabo Delgado Province (Northern Mozambique) where a large Liquefied Natural Gas (LNG) project is planned, and Inhambane Province (Southern Mozambique) where SASOL already has a natural gas production project since 2004 and where further O&G exploration will also take place due to recent discoveries of hydrocarbons (exact location of Oxfam program operations yet to be determined). The program does not incorporate a specific cross-border approach with Tanzania (monitoring, coordination and collaboration), despite the proximity and similarity of circumstances on target areas on both sides of the border and potential for cross-border impacts.

The objective of the baseline survey is to analyze and document the situation around accountability, transparency and governance of the O&G sector in the country prior to the implementation of the Oxfam project. It focuses on a selected group of indicators chosen for the country program logical framework, identified and approved in the Baseline Inception Phase. A total of 33 people were interviewed in the context of this baseline. This was accompanied by a thorough national and international literature review. It was not possible to gain access to some key Government and CSO representatives at sub-national level and any of the three O&G companies contemplated in the context of this baseline, which could affect the comprehensiveness of findings. It is expected that a similar exercise be conducted at the end of the program to gauge the changes brought about by program interventions.

The fieldwork for the baseline was conducted in December 2014. Baseline findings are presented in line with program outcomes, broadly focusing on building the capacities of (i) communities (Outcome 1); (ii) CSOs and the media (Outcome 2) and (iii) Other stakeholders (Outcome 3).

Outcome 1 Key Baseline Findings:

- **Target communities** in Palma, are minimally aware of the *Land Law*. The same does not hold true however in relation to issues that were highlighted by interviewees as are equally important for communities to effectively claim and exercise their rights, namely: communities have almost non-existing knowledge on laws relevant to the O&G context; the “patchy” nature of legislation; understanding of the stages of O&G projects; the attribution of responsibilities among stakeholders in the context of O&G projects. Furthermore, communities do not have the ability to adequately deal with land speculation and the
apparent use of arbitrary criteria for compensation of household assets lost to activities in the O&G projects associated activities in pre-production stage.

- According to key interviewees, **local participation in governance processes** and **decision-making in the context of O&G projects** is improving with the creation of inclusive Community Committees (Comitées da Comunidade) representing the community before all other stakeholders in the context of the O&G project in Palma. These groups enable the community to move away from only “important issues being discussed by important people” (male leaders and their male allies).

- Community Committees have the potential to bring together different social groups for **innovative models of collective engagement and action**. Existing groups to date include kinship, religious and livelihood-based groups, and to a lesser extent political affiliation. The importance is that these groups cannot be underestimated as part of households’ collaborative strategies and safety nets in times of difficulties.

- **Grievance mechanisms** commonly used by rural communities consist in: (i) presentation of concerns to local leaders or local government officials; (ii) presentation of concerns to visitors representing the Government or others seen as capable of transmitting messages to Government authorities. The creation of formal grievance mechanisms is mentioned in Anadarko & ENI’s Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) for both verbal and written complaints. It was not possible however to obtain information on if they have been created, and consequently, their usage or effectiveness.

- In relation to **gender** issues, interviewees were of the opinion that communities are not necessarily specifically concerned about how the industry could affect women if not properly managed and overseen by Government, as gender inequities are not recognized or regarded as problematic. Communities generally express concerns on how projects will affect the community as a whole. The fact that O&G projects are not understood does not allow communities to foresee the wide range of potential effects on them, and more specifically, on women. Secondly, women participate less than men in existing governance venues, both in terms of numbers and voice.

- Very few **studies** have been conducted by stakeholders based in Mozambique on O&G governance and none are dedicated to O&G revenue use. Communities are not involved as subjects but as informants. Oxfam direct program partners produce positioning papers based on experience and opinion, not scientific methods.

**Outcome 2 Key Baseline Findings:**

- Most of the progress in capacities and thus actual **negotiation and advocacy efforts in the context of O&G** appears to have been made at national level just because it is where most decisions - in a largely non-operational O&G industry - are still made. CSOs were not shy to state that they do not oppose to O&G projects, instead they are concerned on ensuring that benefits are spread widely for current and future generations.

- CSOs are cognizant of the **barriers preventing women’s participation in governance processes** but a clear agenda to work towards challenging and overcoming them has not been developed.

- **Laws providing specific protection to women** (Family Law, Law Against Domestic Violence) are understood by organizations fighting specifically for women’s rights. This is likely to be the case as well among most organizations in Cabo Delgado who are members of the Gender Thematic Group in the
Provincial Civil Society Platform FOCADE, at least in what concerns the key issues covered in these laws. This is however not enough; knowledge needs to be strengthened among CSOs on the (i) pervasive inequalities of gender power relations; (ii) common areas of inequality between men and women; (iii) the specific common effects of EI projects on women for effective gender sensitive O&G programing.

- The only formal documents guiding the PNSCRNIE at present are the Memorandum of Understanding signed upon its creation and membership criteria. Advocacy and communication strategies were being produced at the time of this study, which will clarify the specific geographic target areas for joint engagement. Members are cognizant of the need to include members and their constituencies in their work.
- PNSCRNIE’s only source of funding at present is from WWF. Fundraising efforts will be made once the strategies have been approved.
- Mozambique is transitioning from being a highly donor-dependent country to generating its own revenue streams. Concerns have been expressed on the potential lack of continuity on pro-poor focus as pressure from aligned donors reduces. Relative to other countries, Mozambique has little experience with effective gender sensitive budgeting.
- A repository of comprehensive and easily accessible information on O&G does not exist in Mozambique; the need for information at all levels and for all stakeholders in the context of extractives has been identified as a pressing need. IUCN is launching an online information-sharing platform and intends to create an information center in Pemba on the O&G industry with a specific focus on the LNG project in the province as part of its Fair Coasts Project.
- The capacity of the media to critically cover and educate the public on O&G issues is low. Various practical (funding, complexity of information) and structural constraints in journalism as a whole in the country (tradition of reporting events, loyalty to the State, self censorship) contribute to this.
- Public debate is constrained by the structural limitations of journalism in Mozambique. Debates take place and commentators make efforts but according to interviewees, the potential is hardly explored. As such, spokespersons on good governance, accountability and transparency are not highlighted in the media. On the contrary, organizations engaged in such efforts need to make publicity for themselves.

Outcome 3 Key Baseline Findings:

- Contract disclosure has been achieved and the 2013 EITI standards are expected to increase the comprehensiveness of the 5th Mozambican EITI report due to be published in 2015 and the inclusion of PNSCRNIE representatives in the EITI multistakeholder forum is a sign of additional progress. The development of a specific advocacy agenda by the PNSCRNIE will give the platform impetus and focus at national, provincial and district level. The IUCN sponsored Provincial level Sustainable Development Forum offers important opportunities for dialogue and concerted action at Provincial level while offering linkages with national and district / community level. Community Committees are likely to be instrumental in promoting effective dialogue between stakeholders at district level. As such, supporting participation in these spaces appears to be the greatest opportunity for the program.
- Paralegals have been present in Palma District Capital (Cabo Delgado Province) for a couple of years now but limited in terms of activity due to lack of
a supporting structure and financial compensation. CTV has also trained a limited number of paralegals at the community level to be linked to the existing paralegal structures at District and Provincial levels. The structure is expected to grow in number and its capacities strengthened. CTV has supported the process seeking to formalize the role of paralegals in Mozambique. A challenge known by other sectors using volunteers will be sustaining the engagement of people trained.

Every aspect of the O&G industry is moving at a fast pace in Mozambique; governance, accountability and transparency in the sector is not an exception. The number of players in the landscape is also quickly growing as the potential of the industry is far from existing capacities. In this context, it is possible that the program faces a need to incorporate a certain level of flexibility, and embed the capacity to collaborate with others such as Conselho Cristão de Moçambique, FAO, IUCN, UNDP and the World Bank to avoid duplications and promote synergies, as required. It is also possible that experiences on the ground open the door to advocacy opportunities not contemplated to date.
1. INTRODUCTION

Project Objectives
The NORAD-funded Accountability through Active Citizenship Program: Improving Petroleum Governance in Ghana, Mozambique and Tanzania aims to contribute towards an active society that promotes economically, environmentally and socially responsible management of Oil and Gas (O&G) resources based on transparency and accountability for sustainable development and poverty reduction, while safeguarding the needs of future generations.

In Mozambique, program design is based on the premise that good governance in the O&G sector relies on the active and informed participation of all stakeholder groups including communities, Civil Society Organizations (CSO) and the media. Furthermore, it is founded on the recognition that participation is only possible by redressing the power imbalance resulting from unequal access to information, poor awareness of governance and decision-making processes, rights and structural weaknesses in the media sector. As such, in Mozambique the program aims to:

- Empower communities directly affected by O&G projects in Mozambique (Northern Inhambane and Palma District, Cabo Delgado Province) to effectively and constructively participate in governance processes that promote gender and social equity;
- Build the capacity of national and local CSOs and platforms to meaningfully assume an oversight role, support communities, participate in dialogue and advocate for equitable, impactful and lasting development in the context of O&G;
- Build the capacity of the media to increase the quantity and quality of reporting on processes and results associated with O&G projects in Mozambique.

From a gender perspective, the Oxfam program expects to increase women’s effective participation in governance processes associated to O&G projects, avoid common effects of extractive projects on women and contribute to the promotion of gender sensitive poverty reduction in the context of extractives.

It is possible that program design be fine-tuned upon the completion of the baseline and development of operational strategies. The program will also need to adapt to a fast-developing context with an increasing number of players contributing towards similar vision and complementary goals.

The Oxfam program does not encompass a cross-border approach with Tanzania, despite the fact that O&G operations take place very close to the border in both countries, both are target countries for the program and trade linkages exist between communities on both sides of the border. In this context, it is possible that the effects of O&G operations, O&G governance and socio-economic development on one side of the border could affect the communities in the other. This should be considered as a topic in the joint annual meetings supported by NORAD and regular exchange of information specifically between the Tanzania and Mozambique country programs promoted.

The program will be implemented in the Panda – Temane area, Northern Inhambane, where SASOL produces and exports natural gas to South Africa since 2004, or vicinities, where liquid hydrocarbons were discovered in 2013, as well as in Palma District (Afungi Peninsula) where Anadarko and ENI lead the Liquefied Natural Gas
(LNG) project. This latter project has not yet made its Final Investment Decision (FID). Several factors constrain and will determine this decision such as: the existence of legislation regulating LNG export projects\(^1\), profitability margins, acquisition of financing and potential for competitiveness in global gas markets. The community level component of the Oxfam project may need to be substantially strengthened if Anadarko and ENI do not make FID and sell off their assets.

As recent international experience shows, companies with international reputation have to implement their best business interest to “do things right” and avoid one of the main risks faced by O&G companies: social risks. Proof of the engagement of the two lead companies in Palma is that they have involved some of the most reputable professionals at the international, regional and national level for their social investment and resettlement program. The assumption of leadership in O&G development by less conscious players requires higher scrutiny and oversight (Frynas, J.G., 2009).

**Baseline Purpose and Context**

The objective of the baseline survey is to analyze and document the situation around accountability, transparency and governance of the O&G sector in the country prior to the implementation of the Oxfam project. More specifically, the baseline focuses on a selected group of indicators chosen for the country program directly linked to the project’s foreseen key areas of activity, identified and approved in the Baseline’s Inception Phase. It is expected that an exercise similar to this baseline will be conducted at the end of the program to gauge the changes brought about by program interventions.

**Table 1: Indicators Developed for the Baseline in Mozambique, per Program Outcome.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OUTCOMES</th>
<th>INDICATORS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Outcome 1: Women, youth and men improve skills to influence petroleum governance decision-making and to mitigate consequences of oil and gas industries in their locality.</td>
<td>1.1 Understanding of men, women and youth in directly affected communities of land and petroleum legislation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.2 Participation of men, women and youth in decision-making processes around O&amp;G issues at local level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.3 Effective mechanisms for collective action in place at community level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.4 Effective grievance redress mechanisms in place and use (judicial and extrajudicial)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.5 Community understanding of gender impacts of Extractive Industries (EI)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.6 Barriers to women’s participation on decision-making in O&amp;G processes identified and challenged</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.7 Research, analysis and reporting on O&amp;G governance and revenue use at local and sub-national level with consultation / participation of community groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Outcome 2: Civil society organizations and platforms, including women’s rights organizations and media groups, strengthen engagement in economic, environmental, and social</td>
<td>2.1 Need, existence and use of an online platform for O&amp;G</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.2 Advocacy and negotiation skills among SCOs, NGOs and the media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.3 Barriers to women’s participation on decision-making in O&amp;G processes identified and challenged</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.4 Laws protecting the interests and rights of women understood</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| | 2.5 O&G revenue management is gender sensitive and pro-

\(^1\) A Decree-Law was published on 17th December 2014 providing the juridical, contractual, regulatory and fiscal regime of the ENI and Anadarko LNG development and export Project. Current Exploration and Production Concession Contract (EPCC) did not contemplate export of gas in the form of LNG (CIP, October 2014).
oversight and advocacy for improved petroleum revenue management at national and sub-national levels.

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 PSCNRNIE has strategic and investment plans, advocacy agenda for engagement with Government and O&amp;G companies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7 PSCNRNIE National and sub-national advocacy and campaigns supported</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8 Capacity of media based partners around O&amp;G issues</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.9 Interactive radio and TV debates on EI policies, engage power holders, elected representatives and the public</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.10 Media elevates the national and international profile of key platform members as spokespersons for transparency and good governance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.11 Participation in annual global forums, supporting exchange and presentation of national research and policy development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. Outcome 3. Governments and private sector in the petroleum industry become increasingly receptive and responsive to the demands of active citizens, civil society, and media and their responsibility to operate transparently and accountably as duty-bearers.

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Existence of a formal effective mechanism of dialogue to monitor commitments, contract compliance and legislation on community rights</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Paralegals in Cabo Delgado and Inhambane provide quality services to directly affected communities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fieldwork was conducted in Mozambique between the 2nd and 12th December 2014. Activities were carried out in close coordination with key Oxfam Mozambique staff at the start and during the time in country. Preliminary findings were shared with Oxfam staff in Mozambique prior to leaving the country, confirming the validity of the core information of this study.

Overall Country Context

Mozambique is one of the poorest countries in the world with over 54% of the population living under the poverty line; poverty levels have largely remained unchanged since 2003. Internal and external shocks can often deepen poverty, increase vulnerability and affect livelihood sustainability at the household level. Approximately 70% of the population lives in rural areas and is largely dependent on agriculture to meet basic food consumption needs. The country ranks 178/187 in the human development index. Paradoxically, the country has portrayed a relatively stable Gross Domestic Product (GDP) in the last decade averaging 7% per annum. Agriculture, services and large-scale / mega-projects including aluminum smelting and mineral extraction (coal and heavy sands) are the driving forces of the economy.

Recent discoveries of precious and semi-precious stones and minerals (rubies, graphite, diamonds, gold, iron-vanadium, titanium, etc.) and the granting of new blocks for coal exploration in 2014 is expected to result in a rapid increase in the number and scale of exploration activity in the near future. While extractive industries still account for a low 2% contribution to the GDP, the sector has witnessed the largest growth in the last few years, and is expected to continue to grow in the next few years due to the expected increase of mining operations. The larger share of revenue from LNG operations is only to be received by the Government of Mozambique in around 2025.

---

2 MPD, 2010.
3 UNDP, 2014.
after cost-recovery. Bids for 15 new O&G exploration blocks were launched in 2014; the results of the bidding process are likely to be released by mid 2015.

Like all other African countries, Mozambique backed the African Union’s Mining Vision in 2009, of which a core aim is to ensure local development to enable communities to reap benefits from EI and extractive activities safeguard the environment⁴. At the same time, the country became compliant to the Extractive Industry Transparency Initiative (EITI) in 2012 and will be producing the 5th EITI report in 2015⁵ that is expected to meet some of the civil society calls with the application of new EITI standards incorporating higher disclosure requirements. Finally, according to the 2013 Revenue Governance Index published by the Revenue Watch Institute, Mozambique needs to strengthen disclosure of all types of O&G and mineral extraction revenues at national and sub-national level as well as strengthen the ability of institutions in charge of overseeing environmental and social wellbeing in the context of industry projects, and ranks 46/58.

**Primary Change Agents**

*Centro Terra Viva (CTV)* and *Sekelekani Development Communication Centre* are the direct partners under this program in Mozambique. These partners already receive funding for common areas of activity from other donors and expect to continue doing so; partners do however expect to device measures to enable attributability to Oxfam support. The Oxfam program also expects to collaborate with the PNSCRNIE, along with CSOs at sub-national level working towards the same goals.

- **Centro Terra Viva** is a Maputo based Environmental Research and Advocacy Group founded in 2002. One of its core areas of intervention is providing support to communities to claim and secure land rights. Key activities include dissemination of relevant legislation at the community level and support around conflict mitigation, community consultation processes and negotiations with investors. Its experience covers both Inhambane (Jangamo District in the context of a heavy sands project) and Cabo Delgado (Palma District). It works through project staff and paralegals.

- **Sekelekani** is a media-based association created in 2012 seeking to improve the availability of information, and quantity and quality of reporting around O&G and other extractive industries in Mozambique, through the use of appropriate Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs). The organization is currently focused in Cabo Delgado, Inhambane and Tete Provinces.

- **The PNSCRNIE** brings together national and a small number of international organizations aiming to promote participation, transparency and sustainability of natural resource in the context of conservation and exploration projects. Further, it seeks to empower civil society and local communities through the production of relevant research, monitoring, advocacy and public awareness, communication, information sharing and training activities. At national level, the Platform is currently hosted by CTV and represented at sub-national level by member organizations acting at provincial and district level.

- **Potential target communities** livelihood strategies combine commercial and consumption fisheries activities with fruit crops production (cashew, coconut, mangoes) and small-scale agricultural activities (maize, sorghum, manioc). In general terms, communities engage in trade when markets are accessible at local, regional and cross-border level (IUCN, 2014a). Like in other rural

⁴ [http://www.africaminingvision.org/about.html](http://www.africaminingvision.org/about.html).
communities, while livelihood activities face important efficiency challenges affecting outcomes, diversification reduces vulnerability and risk. Salaried employment is not common in the project’s current target areas.

2. METHODOLOGY

Approach
The study is based on a qualitative approach using secondary resources obtained through informants and internet searches, along with semi-structured interviews with key informants. A total of 33 interviews were conducted in Mozambique among key in-country Oxfam staff, CSOs – including project partners, key Government ministries, paralegals active in Cabo Delgado Province, journalists and donors, as depicted in Table 2 below.

Table 2: Baseline interviewees by stakeholder type, in Mozambique.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stakeholder Group</th>
<th>N. of people Interviewed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oxfam Regional and Country Staff</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oxfam Partner Organizations</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Other) Civil Society Organizations</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paralegals</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government Institutions</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journalists</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Donors</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The baseline does not include household or citizen based surveying subject to statistical validity. However efforts were made to quantify qualitative information related to capacity, receptiveness or level of understanding of particular issues among stakeholders. This was done by complementing assessments with value scales. Where possible, documentation confirming information presented by interviewees is also referenced.

Views put forth by interviewees presented in Section 3 of this report (Findings) are expressed against the total number of people amongst which each specific issue was raised with rather than against the total number of interviewees participating in the study. The scoring scale used in the same section spans from 1 – 5; one (1) corresponding to no / very low capacity or knowledge and five (5) corresponding to high level of understanding / competence.

Key Areas of Inquiry
Interview guidelines were produced to cover relevant topics across the range of informants. Broadly, the following areas of inquiry shaped the formulation of the interview guidelines used with each stakeholder group:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Civil Society Organizations</th>
<th>Opinion on community and CSO understanding and competency on relevant legislation, gender barriers affecting women’s participation in governance processes and on common potential effects of extractive projects on women; current and foreseen interventions on transparency, accountability and good governance and access to</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
useful information on O&G.

**Donors**

Key interventions around O&G in Mozambique, perception of the opportunities and challenges around accountability, transparency and good governance in the context of O&G operations in the country.

**Government**

Systems in place promoting accountability, transparency and good governance; recent progress and plans on relevant legislation; opinion on the capacity and legitimacy of interventions by other stakeholders on these issues.

**Media**

Factors constraining journalism around extractives in Mozambique, quality of public debates around O&G and access to useful information on O&G.

**Paralegals**

Understanding by foreseen target communities of relevant legislation and governance processes, work to date in target communities, challenges and opportunities.

**O&G Companies**

Consultation and decision-making mechanisms with communities, measures seeking to re-establish livelihoods of directly affected populations and measures taken to promote gender equity and equality.

**Ethical Considerations**

Semi-structured interviews were preceded by a presentation of key information by the consultant on the Oxfam program aims, key partners, intervention and target geographic areas accompanied by information on the scope and objectives of the baseline.

Interviewees were informed on confidentiality measures considered under the study including: (i) no direct references to informants in baseline report or any other communication produced in the context of the study; (ii) presentation of information avoiding indirect attributability of information to informants; (iii) the exception to the above being public information shared by organizations during the interviews on past or on-going interventions or plans or information publicly disseminated in reports, internet, the media, or other public communication channels. Interviewees were notified that their names would appear in the list of people interviewed in the context of this study.

Verbal informed consent was obtained from all participants. The consultant provided her contact details and invited participants to contact her should there be any additional information they would like to share within a 1-2 week period following the interview. Contact details for the Oxfam Office in Mozambique were provided to interviewees who may wish to inquire further on the baseline or the program itself.

**Study Limitations**

It was not possible to interview any of the O&G Companies contemplated under this study (SASOL, Anadarko and ENI). The coincidence of the fieldwork with the Gas Summit between the 2nd – 5th December 2014 in Maputo could have influenced availability. Members of the Gender Thematic Group and the Natural Resources and Environment Thematic Group of FOCADE (Fórum de Organizações de Cabo Delgado / Forum of CSOs of Cabo Delgado) were not interviewed due to lack of availability of relevant staff because of overlapping events. Finally, it was neither possible to obtain all of the information and documentation requested from CTV on the PNSCRNIE and nor conduct interviews key ministries and provincial government directorates. The impossibility of speaking to some of the key informants results in information gaps that could affect the comprehensiveness of the findings.
Community members were not directly interviewed as a visit to Palma District was not included as part of the fieldwork. In this context, the information included in this report on communities is based on generalizable interviewee knowledge on rural communities in the country and secondary resources. Given that details of the program design had not been fully developed by the time fieldwork started, the target communities in Inhambane Province had not been clearly identified, making it impossible to set a concrete target for inquiry in that province for the baseline.

**Consultant Profile**

The assignment was carried out by Chiqui Arregui, MSc in Social Anthropology from the London School of Economics and Political Sciences. She has over 17 years of experience in development of which 15 based in Mozambique. Her work has covered technical support and senior level management of programs and organizations working with sector Ministries, local CSOs and communities, including six years of experience with two Oxfam affiliates. She offers five years of experience as a senior social development consultant. Chiqui is particularly interested in the development of effective models of multistakeholder engagement in the context of extractives.

The other country reports covering Ghana and Tanzania were prepared by Katinka C. van Cranenburgh and Rob Denny, respectively. External quality assurance was also provided by the Extractives Working Group at ESADE Business School.

### 3. FINDINGS

This section presents summarized information on the situation of key program indicators prior to full implementation of program operations. This will be followed by a brief list of interventions that could be taken into account by the Oxfam team in Mozambique. A summary of findings is also presented in Annex 4.

#### 3.1 Outcome 1: Women, youth and men improve skills to influence petroleum governance decision-making and to mitigate consequences of oil and gas industries in their locality.

**Community Knowledge of Land and Petroleum Law**

The most relevant laws in the context of the program in Mozambique are the Land Law 19/97 of 1st October and corresponding regulations; in the hydrocarbons sector the Petroleum Law 3/2001 of 21st February and the New Petroleum Law 21/2014 (especially articles dealing with community development plans) and the Decree-Law on LNG projects; the Environment Law 20/1997 of 20th October; the Corporate Social Responsibility Law 21/2014 of 16th May/2014, and the Regulations on the Process of Resettlement Resulting from Economic Activities, Decree 31/2012 of 8th August. Communities should also be cognizant of the stages of O&G projects and key processes associated with them. While communities understand that the final guarantor for collective wellbeing is the Government, it is important that just like other stakeholders, communities understand who is responsible for managing and overseeing each aspect of an O&G project. Lastly, new laws or regulations produced in the future dealing with community rights, human rights or prescribing community participation processes should also be considered so as to effectively equip communities to participate in a level-playing field in the context of O&G projects.
Interviewees had mixed views on the level of knowledge of communities on the Land Law countrywide reflected in the middle score of 2.6 in a scale of 1-5 (n=7). 71% of them thought that it is likely that communities directly affected by the LNG project in Palma understand the basics of the Land Law given the interventions of the organization of Iniciativa de Terras Comunitárias (ITC) and CTV in the last few months with funding from another donor. The same does not hold true however with other technical pieces of legislation governing the hydrocarbons sector, and other laws referred to above. All interviewees expressed that these laws are beyond the reach of communities due to their level of technicality, the continuous development of the legislative framework, and the fact that service providers face the same limitations as the communities themselves (this point is further discussed in section 3.2 below). Furthermore, interviewees expressed that key community members in Quitupo - the community that is expected to be resettled in Palma District - are probably aware of the basic core steps of O&G projects, but that these are not likely to be well understood. The fact that Quitupo community signed a Memorandum of Understanding with CTV for assistance and representation (as needed) in public consultations in 2013 could support this view.

It is important that communities also understand the complementary and somewhat “patchy” nature of legislation in Mozambique (and elsewhere), where certain aspects do not necessarily neatly match. Equally important is for communities to understand the circumstances under which each law is applicable and when it is overridden by another law. It is critical for communities to understand that they have rights over their land but that these rights are overridden by projects of strategic interest to the State on the same land. Two situations referred to by interviewees should also be considered in the capacity building efforts targeting communities in the Oxfam program in Palma: (1) how to deal with de facto land speculation, and (2) the inconsistent application of criteria for compensating household asset loss in the wider context surrounding O&G projects.

In terms of tools available to partners to support program aims, CTV has published the Manual for the Demarcation of Community Land through Community Mobilizers (CTV, 2013a) and the Guidelines for Community Consultations (CTV, 2014). While the value of these tools in Portuguese language should not be underestimated, they cover only a small fraction of the topics referred to above.

**Community Participation in O&G Governance Processes**

Participatory governance as a whole is a relatively new concept in Mozambique, presented by the decentralization and deconcentration process. The creation of Consultative Councils (Conselhos Consultivos) at Locality, Administrative Post and District level and their linkage in producing Annual Economic and Social Plans (Plano Económico e Social) is laudable from a theoretical perspective. The level of effectiveness of these forums, such as the District level Development Observatories...
(Observatórios de Desenvolvimento) have been reported to not be representative of the people but rather congregate well-placed individuals (DFID, 2008). The same has been observed in municipalities (Chanhanga, 2010).

As one of the baseline informants indicated, "in Mozambique, important issues are discussed by important people", as such, people present in participatory governance venues are generally well-positioned males directly linked to local political power structures. This opinion is supported by some of the interviewees who feel that formal governance processes in the country discriminate men, women, youth and other social groups alike. Moreover, in their view, rural communities are the victims of any and all economic interests – large or small – because of the combined effects of communities limited awareness and inability to claim rights, and compensations being both arbitrary and inadequate.

The need for communities to be consulted and involved in decision-making is widely expressed across Mozambican legislation across different sectors. In the context of the Palma O&G project, different stakeholders are of the agreement that the number and quality of consultations have increased at all levels: community, district and provincial level (IUCN, 2014a). However, public documents received from Oxfam partners (CTV, 2013a, Selekelekeani, Vieira Mário (a) and (b)) challenge the legitimacy of consultation processes. Beyond the heated debate around the topic, what this situation highlights – as with most participatory governance processes in Mozambique – is that there is a need to strengthen the capacity of communities to participate in such processes. Participation is more than just presence, it requires being equipped to engage, contest, collaborate and negotiate in an informed fashion. These notions are consistent with the principle of Free, Prior and Informed Consent upheld by Oxfam.

According to interviewees, Community Committees (Comités da Comunidade) were created between 2013 and 2014 in key communities in Palma District, namely, in Quitupo (community directly affected by the LNG project), Palma Sede and Maganja. The objective of these 12-member groups is to effectively represent the all key social groups present at community level in the dialogue with stakeholders related to the Palma LNG project. According to interviewees, the proposal to constitute these groups came from CTV.

A Resettlement Commission (Comissão Técnica de Acompanhamento e Supervisão do Reassentamento) operates in Palma District, as well as at Provincial level. It is not clear whether this group involves community members or not (which would be specially relevant at local level), as those interviewed had no information on this issue.

**Mechanisms in Place at Community Level for Collective Action**

In Palma, where the LNG project is expected to be implemented, social capital rates highest over other forms of capital thus bearing a strong influence on household livelihood choices and outcomes. People collaborate and support one another based on their kinship and religious ties, neighborliness and livelihood activities. However, there is a marked absence of livelihood type based associations; some formed in the past have allegedly disintegrated due to lack of insufficient support to increase productive activities (IUCN, 2013). As a matter of fact, the Provincial (Smallholder) Farmers’ Union (UPC, União Provincial de Camponenses) has less than half a dozen member-associations in that District (IUCN, 2014a).

A large fisheries project, ProPESCA, funded by the International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD), aims to create fishery growth poles along the Mozambican coastline, including four in Cabo Delgado, and specifically in the District of Palma. It is
expected that this project consolidates associative activities along the fisheries value chain. Details of how this will play out in light of the Palma LNG project and associated infrastructural work are yet to be seen. Should the IFAD project meet favorable conditions, the district of Palma has the potential of seeing collective action for artisanal fisheries improve. The same could hold true in the context of the interest of the Aga Khan Foundation in contributing towards the development of the cashew nut value chain in the District (IUCN, 2014a).

As reported by seven interviewees, in Palma, the Comités da Comunidade offer a new and more inclusive model of participation engaging social groups traditionally marginalized from public decision-making forums: youth and women. This is especially relevant in communities in Palma where traditional values may clash with those of the youth (IUCN, 2013).

**Grievance Mechanisms for O&G Projects in Place and Use**

Rural communities in Mozambique use two primary channels for the presentation of needs, complaints and queries: (i) local leadership structures and (ii) incoming visitors, especially government representatives.

According to IPIECA⁶ and the International Finance Corporation (IFC) Performance Standards, grievance mechanisms are regarded both as one of the most effective tools for social impact monitoring and for the promotion and protection of human rights as part and parcel of companies’ responsibility to respect communities (IFC, 2009). When they exist, these are included in companies’ Environmental and Social Management Plans (ESMP) and should be guided by country legislation and sound business practice. Some examples of Anadarko & ENI’s intent in establishing effective grievance procedures are reflected in publicly available company documents, including:

- Anadarko´s ESMP for Deep-water Seismic Survey in Rovuma Offshore Area 1, which indicates that grievance procedures shall be put in place in the context of artisanal fisheries and other economic activities such as tourist operations and diving centers⁷.
- Anadarko & ENI’s Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) indicates that grievance mechanisms would be created for both verbal and written complaints as part of the stakeholder engagement strategy (ERM & Anadarko, 2014).

Interviewees were not able to confirm if these grievance mechanisms were already in place or not.

Lastly, the Office of the United Nations High Commission for Human Rights (OHCHR) currently supports the Government of Mozambique in the development of a national action plan for human rights based on the United Nations Guiding Principles on Human Rights⁸ for the country’s extractive sector⁹. Part of the guiding principles are, in effect, those enabling access to remedy, including judicial mechanisms, non-judicial, state based non-judicial mechanisms and company grievance mechanisms. The Oxfam program should be attentive to developments in this front.

---

⁸ The development of these Guiding Principles was led by the former Special Representative of the UN Secretary-General, Professor John Ruggie.
Community Understanding of Gender Impacts of EI

Interviewees expressed mixed opinions in respect to the level of understanding by communities of the common potential impacts of Extractive Industry (EI) projects on women and gender relations; 71% of informants (n=7) rated this below the middle score of 2.5, and was further justified by stating that (i) communities do not critically view gender inequities, and (ii) communities – and other stakeholders for that matter – do not understand many of the impacts that could be brought about as a result of ineffective O&G project management and lack of Government oversight.

Twenty-nine percent (29%) of interviewees expressed that it is common for men, women and youth to inquire about some specific issues such as their livelihoods, access to water, schools, hospitals and markets in the face of potential change resulting from investment projects involving resettlement. In their view, both men and women can see how worsening conditions in any of these areas could affect women in the community and household wellbeing, even when these are presented in conjunction with other issues.

The fact that in general, communities do not challenge the status quo of gender relations and are unaware of the processes and potential consequences of O&G projects, does not enable communities to list, understand and monitor all potential impacts of such projects on women. The male dominated nature of Mozambican society – even in matrilineal areas – certainly also contributes to this.

Barriers to Women’s Participation in Decision-Making in O&G Processes Identified and Challenged

The key challenges associated to the level of effectiveness of participatory governance processes was already discussed above. Women however, face collective AND specific constraints limiting their ability to participate in decision-making processes.

Culture and patriarchal norms constitute, in interviewees opinion, a key constraining factor for women’s participation in governance processes, including those governing O&G projects, in Palma taking the form of “consultations”, even when gender parity is met. Traditionally, it is not expected for women to express their views, needs and wishes in public spheres. To this they add that women do not have the experience of participating in public venues such as community consultations.

Women’s assumption of both productive (producing / bringing food for the family, fetching water and firewood) and reproductive roles (child rearing, household management, caretaker) in rural areas has been widely recognized to result in an uneven distribution of tasks and responsibilities leaving much less free time for women to participate in community affairs / meetings. This is especially true for female-headed households and other women in very poor households.

Women’s limited participation in community affairs is palpable even in the Comités da Comunidade. Information made available by interviewees indicated that only one of the three groups (the one based in Palma Sede, the one located in the most urbanized location of the three) shows gender parity with six men and six women constituting the group. In the cases of Quitupo and Maganja female representation is lower, namely with only two and four women respectively, out of a total of 12 members. Interviewees who have participated in such meetings indicate that women’s level of engagement largely remains unchanged, but that youth voice their concerns and wishes with renewed vigor and strength.
One of the informants indicated that the local language *Ekimwani* (language spoken mainly by men) is generally used in community meetings in Palma; according to the same informant, women in the area mostly speak another local language *Emakwa*. It is understood that public consultations take place in Portuguese (it was not possible to confirm whether simultaneous translation was offered for the language preferences of both men and women referred to above), but it was not possible to ascertain the degree to which this factor affects, in fact, women’s participation in Community Committees.

**Research, Analysis and Reporting on O&G Governance and Revenue Use at Local and Sub-National Level With Consultation / Participation of Community Groups**

An analysis of the recent research reveals that very few studies have been conducted by stakeholders based in Mozambique on O&G Governance in recent years. None of the studies available are dedicated to the issue of O&G revenue use at national or subnational level. A quick look at studies referred to by interviewees shows that studies involving communities directly affected by O&G projects do exist, but these are dedicated to socio-economic issues and women and extractives. Studies have had a national and sub-national dimension, and have involved international organizations and Mozambican CSOs. Moreover, studies done on the O&G industry and associated matters do not involve communities as subjects but rather as part of the wide range of informants. Table 4 provides a summary of the studies referred to by interviewees.

*Table 4: Summary of studies and analyses carried out by organizations based in Mozambique around O&G issues in recent years.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>National Level</th>
<th>Sub-national Level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>IESE</strong> – Macro-economic studies. Interesting background for governance and economic issues.</td>
<td><strong>AECID / MMAS</strong> - Impact of E1 on women (2013, but not yet released by MMAS)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CIP</strong> – Accountability and transparency mainly on EITI, policy &amp; process analysis.</td>
<td><strong>IUCN</strong> - Livelihoods and Socio-Economic Assessment of Coastal Communities in Palma District, Cabo Delgado Province, Mozambique (2013)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CCM</strong> – Socio-Economic Impacts of Extractives in Palma (to be released in February 2015).</td>
<td><strong>CTV</strong> - Projetos de Exploração de Gás Natural em Palma: As Questões de Fundo por de trás das Acusações de “Agitadores” Proferidas contra o CTV (2013)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>UNICEF</strong> - Resources, Revenues and Social Development: Prospects and Challenges for the Extractive Sector in Mozambique (2012)</td>
<td><strong>Sekelekani &amp; Vieira Mário</strong> - Já Ninguém Bate Palmas... em Palma; Reassentamentos em Palma, entre Expectativas e Incertezas; Policial ou Comunicar com Quítupo: Eis a Questão.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The two project partners have produced a number of papers in the last 24 months. However, rather than consisting of studies based on scientific and internationally recognized methodologies, the papers document opinions, based on experiences and does not place them on an equal footing to others. Identifying the reasons for this was beyond the scope of this study.

**In Conclusion**

Community capacity to exercise rights is limited, with limited knowledge levels on different laws and processes. Current challenges faced by communities indicates that capacity building needs to go beyond just laws considered to date.

Participants in governance processes need to be supported (for example, each of the social groups present in the *Comités da Comunidade* created in Palma) require support to be adequately prepared to actively engage. Needs, willingness, availability and experience in participating in such processes could differ among the different
participating social groups (men, women, youth) and needs to be taken into account. These groups have the potential of developing into a broader structure for joint action, alongside with potential livelihood groups that could be enhanced through development projects in the fisheries and agriculture sector.

The scope of gender related interventions need to be carefully assessed and clearly established, especially at community level given that it in rural communities where women face the highest degree of inequality. However care must be placed in focus areas given that overcoming structural imbalances is beyond the scope and reach of this project.

Men, women and youth from communities have not been involved in research on O&G issues other that as informants. The project will need to determine the exact realistic change goal it seeks to achieve in this respect.

### Recommendations:

- Rather than focusing on Land and Petroleum Law, broaden the scope to develop a toolkit of issues that communities should understand (laws, processes, responsibilities, dynamics).
- Make sure to include preparatory support to adequately engage in governance processes in the program, ensuring that it meets the potentially differing needs of each type of participant (men, women, youth).
- The scope of gender issues to be covered at community level should concentrate on: a) raising community awareness of the common impact of mismanaged O&G projects on women, b) raising community capacity to monitor such potential impacts, c) raising awareness, capacity and actual participation of women in governance processes, research interventions and media reporting, d) ensuring that grievances affecting women are effectively reported and redressed.
- Simplification of existing tools created by partners for use at community level and creation of others needed with translation into the main local languages spoken by affected communities should be explored. The development of a “toolbox” would appear to be useful for service providers to use to cater to the needs of each specific community.
- Support program partners in strengthening their participatory research capacities.

### 3.2 Outcome 2: CSOs and platforms, including women’s rights organizations and media groups, strengthen engagement in economic, environmental, and social oversight and advocacy for improved petroleum revenue management at national and sub-national levels.

#### Advocacy and Negotiation Skills among CSOs and the Media

Capacity to advocate and negotiate among CSOs was reported by stakeholders to be varied, depending on the geographic location of organizations, with a higher appreciation of capacities at national level (rated on a scale from 1 to 5 at 3 (n=6) for CSOs based in Maputo versus 1.5 (n=6) for those based at provincial / district level). Civil Society as such is still very young in Mozambique but important strides have been made by CSOs in gaining space and voice in Mozambique in the last 10-15 years.
Despite the progress made in decentralization, governance in Mozambique is still transitioning from a centralized State. The real issue for CSOs appears to be that the space for them is not naturally there; as one of the CSO interviewees pointed out “it is not only about our efforts or capacity to influence; it is also about the Government’s degree of influenciability”.

Specifically around O&G, CSO efforts enabled members of PNSCRNIE to be integrated in the in-country EITI multistakeholder group, present comments to laws unsolicitedly or respond rapidly to last minute requests at short notice. Some of the issues high at present in the CSO agenda include influencing the independence of the new High Authority on Extractive Industries through the integration of civil society representatives, influencing the processes for effective and coordinated participation of CSOs in the drafting of laws, regulations, policies and processes, identifying new ways of exercising advocacy (namely, enhancing the impact of studies and analyses), as well as increasing constructive dialogue, participation and transparency at the local level. CSOs were not shy to state that they do not oppose O&G projects, instead they are concerned about ensuring that benefits are spread widely for current and future generations.

The landscape of CSOs in Mozambique shows both specialized CSOs dedicated to research and advocacy and others playing a service role to communities, the latter being more common at the district and provincial level. As mentioned above, most of the progress in negotiation and advocacy appears to have been made at national level because it is where most decisions - in a largely non-operational O&G industry - are still made. As the O&G project moves further into operations, opportunities for negotiation and advocacy will increase for CSOs at sub-national level.

It is also true that CSOs based in Maputo encounter limitations and are not able to engage in just any task related to O&G, as was shown after the publishing of the Anadarko and ENI ESIA, when CSOs were not able to scrutinize and present a critical review of the document and an international organization (IUCN) led the process. Lastly, the increasing rise of donor dependent CSOs also heightens their vulnerability through competition over funding and threatens cohesiveness. At times, organizations simply do not know and understand the strategies of peer organizations.

Interviewees were in agreement that the media in Mozambique does not have the capacity to advocate or participate in negotiation processes (for more information please see information provided on media specific indicators in this section of the report). However, one media channel in Cabo Delgado Province (Jornal Horizonte) was found to be part of a network (FOCADE) of organizations that could potentially be involved in O&G advocacy activities at sub-national level.

Understanding of Petroleum Laws and Land Law

Specialized CSOs such as ITC, CTV and the Smallholder-Farmers Provincial Union (União Provincial dos Camponeses, UPC) have a solid understanding of the Land Law (rated at 5; n=6); while the rating of other non-specialized CSOs averaged 2 (n=6). The program partner CTV includes the Environment Law in the core package of laws underpinning their work in support of communities to obtain and exercise their land rights. Both program partners Sekelekani and CTV are cognizant of core issues associated with O&G projects that affect communities, namely: (i) land rights, (ii) the need and nature for consultation processes; (iii) the need for fair and transparent compensation for loss of assets and other rights of communities.
On the other hand, the Petroleum Law and the other laws relevant for the O&G industry are mostly understood only by specialized organizations at national level, most prominently, the members of the PNSCRNIE. CSOs based in Cabo Delgado, even those that are members of the national CSO platform, require assistance in understanding these highly technical pieces of legislation (IUCN, 2014a). Moreover, the evolving nature of the legislative context is yet another factor accounting for knowledge gaps. In 2014 alone several legislative instruments were approved and published: The CSR Law, the New Petroleum Law and the Decree-Law governing LNG contracts.

Until the conduction of the fieldwork for this study, no mechanisms to systematically build the capacity of CSOs at national, provincial or district level were reported to be in place or planned. Eighty three percent (83%) of people interviewed (n=6) considered the level of understanding of laws and processes associated to O&G projects <2 among non-specialized CSOs.

It must be noted as well that Mozambique has very limited experience with O&G projects and CSOs with large-scale economic projects and resettlement processes. As such, issues such as the stress that livelihood strategies can suffer after resettlement, understanding who is responsible for what, and the patchy nature of legislation need to be better understood by CSOs.

**Barriers to Women´s Participation in Decision-Making in O&G Processes Identified and Challenged**

The main barriers limiting participation of women in decision-making processes were identified in the section devoted to Outcome one (section 3.1). Specialized CSOs working on O&G issues at national level acknowledge that they have not explored how to integrate gender into their work. This is the case with the PNSCRNIE, IESE and CIP.

None of the Mozambican CSOs specialized on women`s rights at national or sub-national level, including the most prominent ones, the Mozambican delegation of Women and Law in Southern Africa (WLSA) and Forum Mulher have developed a specific agenda for the emerging O&G landscape.

Specialized organizations at local level such as Muleide, the Associação Moçambicana de Mulheres de Carreira Jurídica (a women`s legal support organization), and other non-specialized organizations active in Cabo Delgado province (including Palma District) have an understanding of gender issues; some such as UPC are starting to even explore transformative gender approaches (IUCN, 2014). These organizations and others are cognizant of the barriers preventing women`s participation in governance processes but a clear agenda to overcome these barriers has not yet been developed.

People in leadership positions within the Oxfam partner organizations under this program, namely, CTV and Sekelekani, have a good theoretical grounding of key gender issues. However, their organizations have not yet integrated transformative gender objectives and strategies into their internal strategic plans. It was very encouraging to hear that both organizations are currently engaged in developing such organizational strategies.

Interviewees stated that the media have very limited understanding of the barriers limiting the participation of women in any governance processes. As expressed by two of the interviewees, for the media gender equates women, structural inequalities of power relations between men and women are not understood or challenged as journalism in Mozambique in their view, remains a male dominated arena.
Laws Protecting the Interests and Rights of Women Understood

The Mozambican Constitution grants equal rights to men and women. Specific laws such as the Family Law 10/2004 of 25th August and the Law Criminalizing Domestic Violence 26/2009 of 29th September provide specific protection to women in the context of marital unions, and seek to criminalize and prevent violence against women and other family members. According to the interviewees, these generally understood by women’s rights organizations. This is also expected to be the case among most organizations in Cabo Delgado who are members of the Gender Thematic Group in the Provincial Civil Society Platform FOCADE.

Yet, while there is a general awareness of the need to include “gender” in development programs in Mozambique, it is very common for organizations non-specialized CSOs to understand this to mean “including women”. This in turn is often translated in ensuring parity of participation in meetings, equal targeting quotas for men and women and/or reporting gender-disaggregated data. Dimensions such as inequality of gender power relations, common areas of inequality between men and women and the specific common effects of EI projects on women are not well known or considered as part of the issues that need to be addressed to effectively empower women, bring about positive and transformative change in power relations and decision-making processes.

PNSCRNIE Has Strategic Plan, Investment Plan, Advocacy Agenda for Engagement with Government and O&G Companies

The PNSCRNIE was formally created in 2011 with support from the Norwegian Government through the World Wildlife Fund for Nature (WWF). The platform is currently led by one of the program partners, namely CTV. According to the information obtained from interviewees and from existing reports (IUCN, 2014a), the only formal document guiding the PNSCRNIE at present is the Memorandum of Understanding signed upon its creation and membership criteria. Members have also been actively working on the finalization of the Platform’s strategic plan.

Advocacy and communication strategies were being produced at the time of this study with support from WWF. The aim of these strategies is to identify the areas that all platform members agree to work on collectively and the agenda that they will seek to influence as a group. Until recently, the Platform’s geographic area of attention was Tete Province where massive coal extraction activities are taking place. Informants indicated that one of the platform members “took them” to Palma District, as this had not been identified as a target area by the entire group. The advocacy strategy will clarify if this specific geographic area is of the interest of the group as a whole.

Some of the successes of the Platform highlighted by interviewees are the creation of the Mozambican chapter of Publish What You Pay, participation in the EITI multistakeholder group, the conduction of a social audit of Palma District and the establishment of communication “protocols” between the Ministry of Mineral Resources (MIREM, Ministério de Recursos Minerais) and CSOs.

PNSCRNIE National and Subnational Advocacy and Campaigns Supported

The only source of funding at present of the PNSCRNIE comes from WWF. Platform members are aware of the need to match advocacy campaigns with specific geographic targets, including members and their constituencies from the provinces and budgeting associated costs. These details will be included in the Advocacy and Communication Strategies presently under development.
The Platform plans to engage in fundraising efforts once the strategies have been approved.

**O&G Revenue Management is Gender Sensitive and Pro-Poor**

Donors feel that they have played an important role in the country in promoting pro-poor management by the Government of Mozambique. Concerns have however been expressed on the potential lack of continuity on pro-poor focus as the Government shifts from dependence on aligned donors (in Mozambique called the Program Aid Partners or G-19) to non-aligned donors such as China, Brazil, India, and increases revenue streams from extractives (Astill-Brown, J. & Weimer, M., August 2010; Macuane, J. 2012).

Laws 11/2007 and 12/2007 of 27th June regulating mining and petroleum taxation regimes specify that a percentage of revenues should be channeled to communities directly affected by O&G operations; the percentage being determined yearly with the approval of the State Budget. Information obtained from an interviewee indicates that the percentage in the last three years has remained stable at 2.75%. However, it was not possible to obtain information on what this amount was effectively equal to in absolute numbers for the period nor an exact definition on who the “beneficiary community” was.

Four interviewees were unanimous on the need for clarity on the definition of “communities where the O&G exploration takes place”. Without such a definition it becomes virtually impossible for Provincial and /or District Governments to respond to increasing inquiry by different stakeholders around this matter. As a couple of the interviewees expressed the following needs to be better understood:

- Does this refer to “the directly affected communities”?
- Did it refer to the Locality / Administrative Post / District / Region of the Province?

At the same time, the Ministry of Finance and the Ministry of Planning and Development issued a Circular at the beginning of each year indicating the criteria to be observed for the use of these funds at community level. For example, the Circular for 2013 indicated that the funds should be used for “priority areas aiming to encourage local economic development”, with the involvement of the Consultative Councils (Conselhos Consultivos) at Locality Level. For that same year, the projects eligible for funding were circumscribed to infrastructure in education, health, agriculture, markets, local forests, roads and bridges and water and sanitation infrastructure.

Addressing the needs of directly affected communities, especially if it involves resettlement, should be addressed by O&G companies’ ESMPs. If the target refers in fact to a larger geographic area, how is the use of these funds by the Government coordinated with other Social / Community Investment Programs developed by O&G companies? In this context, and despite potential noble efforts by the Government, it is unclear to what degree O&G revenue management is pro-poor.

While the Government incorporates the promotion of gender equality in all of its key strategic documents, including the Five Year Government Plan and annual plans, the country as a whole has little experience with effective gender sensitive budgeting (Matusse, C. & Nhantumbo, A., 2007; ECOSOC, 2014).

**Need, Existence and Use of an Online Platform for CSOs, NGOs and Media on O&G**
To date, the private sector, and more specifically O&G companies, are the largest producer of information related to O&G projects in the country. In the view of most CSO interviewees, however, only a small fraction of what is produced is actually available to the public.

According to interviewees, CSOs and the media do not have access to a repository of comprehensive and easily accessible information that the lay reader can understand; the need for information at all levels and for all stakeholders in the context of extractives has been identified as a pressing need (IUCN, 2014). To meet this need in Cabo Delgado, the area with the largest O&G project approved to date, IUCN is launching an online information-sharing platform and intends to create an information center in Pemba around the O&G industry with a specific focus on the LNG project in Palma as part of its Fair Coasts Project. The same project also aims to create a communication strategy to use various media tools to communicate on issues related to the project and the decisions made under the Sustainable Development Forum (for further details, please see Section 4.1 below).

**Capacity of Media Based Partners Around O&G Issues**

The media in Mozambique was consistently described by interviewees – including journalists themselves – as suffering from several important constraints limiting their ability to engage in quantity and quality coverage of O&G developments in Mozambique.

All interviewees (n=9) indicated that logistical and material constraints strongly limit access of journalists to the remote locations where O&G projects are being developed, along with the highly technical – and not easily graspable - nature of O&G issues.

Interestingly though, two additional constraining factors were referred to by three interviewees as having an even stronger influence on O&G reporting, namely, the history and nature of Mozambican journalism in general. According to these informants, the fact that media channels were created and have been strongly sponsored by the State since Independence has created a certain culture around journalism. In this context, in Mozambique journalism has equaled reporting events, following Government individualities and has been come to be labeled as “event-based journalism” (Rodrigues, A., 2014). Consequently, in their view, the trajectory of journalism has not been conducive for developing an inquisitive spirit among reporters, or allowed them to develop specialization and skills to transform complex issues into simple information that educates spectators and promotes informed debate.

Journalists interviewed are of the opinion that reporters in Mozambique have participated in a large number of short training courses. However, most of these did not work with journalists towards generating actual results; journalists just went from one training to another and nothing changed in terms of improving the quality of reporting in the country.

Trainings following the same strategies will in their view not produce intended results. Two of the interviewees were also of the opinion that it is important to target editors, which would in turn enable the media to practice agenda setting around extractives.

According to an international report (Government of the USA, 2013) journalists suffer from self-censorship. This statement was supported by more than 50% of the interviewees (n=9). One of the interviewees alerted that a capacity building strategy that could be seen as having great potential for success in isolation, could generate important risks for open confrontation and increasing distrust between the media and
the Government if care was not taken to avoid it. In this informant’s view this inevitably lead to the entrenchment of self-censorship.

The only media channel that was referred to as covering O&G operations in Palma was Jornal Horizonte, a Pemba-based independent paper that considers itself a social intervention media. According to interviewees, the only Mozambican community radio station that reaches parts of Palma, is the community radio from Montepuez.

Interactive Radio and TV Debates on EI Policies, Engage Power Holders, Elected Representatives and the Public

According to interviewees, about 12 public debates on O&G issues were broadcasted in either television or radio in the 12 months prior to this baseline; the frequency of these debates in their opinion, could not be predicted. Interviewees stated that while commentators made efforts to engage in the difficult and complex topics of O&G, the quality of discussions and debate was rather low (scoring between 1.75 in average in a scale of 1-5; n=9). Competent speakers were said to have been invited to participate (senior staff from MIREM and CIP were mentioned), but the level of understanding of the issues and preparation among commentators resulted in their view in debates not being very informative. An interviewee noted that “those that understand O&G issues talk amongst themselves”.

These views are consistent with the opinion of interviewees that, in general, media channels in Mozambique have limited capacity to critically engage in discussions that encourage a diverse and informed public opinion.

Media Elevates the National and International Profile of Key Platform Members as Spokespersons for Transparency and Good Governance

As explained above, the nature of journalism in Mozambique is not critical nor does it intend to educate the public opinion and generate constructive debate. In this context, it is not surprising to find that the media in Mozambique has not aimed to elevate the profile of key spokesperson for transparency and good governance in the context of O&G. Organizations working on the promotion of good governance and transparency from different angles, such as IESE, CIP, Justiça Ambiental, CTV, and others, produce and disseminate their own products. Organizations often produce short texts, which are then reprinted in papers.

Participation in Annual Global Forums, Supporting Exchange and Presentation of National Research and Policy Development

Interviewees only referred to participating in two venues aiming to contribute to program and policy development and research in the context of extractives, namely:

- Alternative Mining Indabas in neighboring South Africa;
- Conferences on Extractive Industries in Maputo and in selected Provinces.

According to the information provided program partners have participated, albeit to a limited degree in the events carried out in Mozambique.

In Conclusion

Command of the Land and Petroleum laws is limited to specialized CSOs; those interested in governance and accountability congregate in the PNSCRNIE, which will consolidate with the finalization of strategic internal guiding documents in 2015. It is not clear to what degree it will be possible for the Platform to secure funding for advocacy and involvement of constituencies in the implementation of their plans.
Not much has been done yet to integrate of a gender lens in governance and accountability programs and in the O&G sector at large is the country; neither specialized nor non-specialized CSOs have yet developed a gender agenda for O&G projects in Mozambique. It is positive to see though that a consultancy was carried out to propose how build the capacity for gender mainstreaming in the energy sector in the country (Hirvonen, 2014).

The media faces structural and practical constraints limiting its ability to critically report and educate the public; technical complexity of O&G is yet another constraining factor. Moreover, an interviewee noted that capacity-building strategies need to include risk-mitigating measures. This appears to be consistent with the widespread desire among stakeholders on journalism needing to make headway towards critical and free thought without journalists becoming “enemies of the State”. In this context, and consistent with the spirit seen throughout the fieldwork, for journalists to assume a legitimately needed role in the context of extractives, the comment on the need to mitigate the risk of confrontation and distrust seems more relevant than at face value.

Apparent duplications have been identified already between the Oxfam program and other programs. Ensuring that duplications are avoided will require persistent efforts around information sharing and coordinating with others.

**Recommendations:**

- Support capacity building at provincial and district level beyond program partners to respond to general capacity needs in the context of O&G projects, through trainings on areas such as the relevant legal framework and how to equip communities to tackle emerging challenges in the context such as land speculation, sharing tools and material produced, etc.

- The scope of gender related outputs among partner organizations is on strengthening capacities for key gender sensitive O&G programing (to train and support communities, advocate and to oversee budget monitoring and CSR). Program partner capacity development efforts in this respect should be supported and linkages between Oxfam in-country programs with CSOs specialized in women’s rights explored.

- Broader training around gender sensitive programming could guide the definition of gender sensitive indicators within the Oxfam program. However such trainings could be include other organizations active in the program target areas, as possible. Issues that could be considered include the following:
  - Importance of understanding the situation of women (conduct gender analyses, ensuring that community baselines are gender sensitive, etc.),
  - Ensuring that women are consulted on their preferences and that they are effectively involved in decisions around social investment associated to O&G projects,
  - Ensuring that the livelihoods of resettled women (including women headed households and other women in situations of vulnerability) are restored, increasing the potential of women’s control over productive resources and access to key social services (in line with national sector legislation) after resettlement,
  - Monitoring coping strategies adopted by men and women and their effects on women, security and safety risks, among others.

- Interviewees were of the opinion that interventions aiming to improve reporting in O&G in Mozambique need to be results-based oriented, include
on-the-job training, promote linkages with peers at international level and contribute to overcoming a tendency for self-censorship. In addition, given that other actors are also working in supporting the media, such as USAID and IUCN, synergies with these initiatives should be explored and nurtured.

- To avoid the risk of creating confrontation between reporters and the Government, the program could consider the following measures: ensuring that a critical mass of media channels buy into the vision put forth for the media in the Oxfam project, liaising with other like-minded media support projects in other sectors to work towards a common vision of journalism in the country, contribute to strengthening linkages between CSOs and the media, and work with donors, NGOs, CSOs and Government to ensure that the media is included in the development of a level-playing field for O&G in Mozambique.

- Liaise with IUCN and explore potential for alignment of purposes and collaboration on the creation of online platforms with the view of avoiding duplications and increasing effectiveness and efficiency.

- Likewise, it is important that the program encourage partners and others to increase their knowledge around resettlement in the context of large-scale economic projects, including the experience in the context of the SASOL project in Pande-Temane.

- Given CSO limited experience with resettlement programs, and the need in country to consolidate learning in this area, it would be advisable to seek and engage with qualified academic and CSO partners in the conduction of a longitudinal study with directly affected households. Such a study, conducted with scientific rigor would provide invaluable knowledge for stakeholders in Mozambique.

3.3 Outcome 3: Governments and private sector in the petroleum industry become increasingly receptive and responsive to the demands of active citizens, civil society, and media and their responsibility to operate transparently and accountably as duty-bearers.

Existence of Effective Formal Mechanism of Dialogue to Monitor Commitments, Contract Compliance and Legislation on Community Rights

Mozambique has made visible progress in terms of transparency and accountability. Contract disclosure has been achieved and the 2013 EITI standards are expected to increase the comprehensiveness of the 5th Mozambican EITI report due to be published in 2015. Moreover, the inclusion of PNSCRNIE representatives in the EITI multistakeholder forum is an important sign of progress, even if almost all CSOs expressed that they continue to feel that there is resistance from the Government of Mozambique in opening the space for CSOs. The development of a specific advocacy agenda by PNSCRNIE will give the platform impetus and focus at the national, provincial and district level (in the geographic areas of focus yet to be identified, which might overlap with the Oxfam program).

At the Provincial level, the IUCN-sponsored Sustainable Development Forum is a level playing field offering important opportunities for dialogue, coordination and concerted action of all stakeholders relevant to the Palma LNG project. One of the potential tasks to be contemplated by that Forum, as expressed by stakeholders, could be supporting the Ministry for the Coordination of Environmental Affairs’ (MICOA, Ministério para a
Coordenação da Acção Ambiental) efforts in monitoring Anadarko and ENI’s ESMP. In addition, the Forum seeks to establish linkages with national level stakeholders and districts - directly affected district (Palma) and indirectly affected area between the Pemba and Palma corridor (IUCN, 2014a). This forum is inspired by the benefits at international level of multi-stakeholder forums in the context of extractives, to improve coordination and tackle challenges that no stakeholder alone can handle (IUCN, 2014b).

Community Committees (Comitês da Comunidade) with the support of paralegals and Oxfam program partners are likely to be instrumental in promoting effective dialogue between stakeholders at the district-level.

The structures referred to in this section (EITI, the PNSCRNIE, the Cabo Delgado Sustainable Development Forum and the Community Committees) and associated processes have been created by different entities to meet perceived transparency, governance and accountability needs that are not uncommon in countries with young democratic governance structures and cultures and new to O&G. The issue of relevance in the context of the Oxfam program (and others) is contributing to influencing the consolidation of these structures.

**Paralegals in Cabo Delgado and Inhambane Provide Quality Services to Directly Affected Communities**

The Mozambican Judicial and Judiciary Training Centre (CFJJ, Centro de Formação Jurídica e Judiciária) developed a training curriculum for paralegals used by ITC, CTV and others in country. CTV has been engaged with the Institute for Sponsorship and Provision of Legal Support (IPAJ, Instituto de Patrocínio e Assistência Jurídica) as well as with the CFJJ to formalize the role of paralegals in Mozambique. A second national seminar took place on the 17th December 2014 covering this issue (CTV, 2014b). As in many other provinces in the country, Cabo Delgado has an Association of Paralegals (ASPACADE, Associação de Paralegais de Cabo Delgado). Interviewees indicated that there is an intention to create a similar association at the District-level to be called Association of Paralegals in Palma (ASPALMA, Associação de Paralegais de Palma). Current plans are for the Association to be constituted by some paralegals that already collaborate with CTV, based in Palma District Capital – not at the community-level. CTV’s work done to date and envisaged for the near future involves the consolidation of community capacities through community-level paralegals that can provide support on:

- Setting up consultation meetings
- Preparing communities for community consultations
- Accompanying and supporting community members in community consultations
- Establishment of mechanisms at the community-level for legal support (caravana jurídica)

Information collected indicates that only six of these community paralegals exist in Palma District, spread across Quitupo and Banja. These community members would receive support from ASPALMA who would in turn be linked to ASPACADE.

Information obtained from CTV indicates that, at present, they work with eight paralegals in Cabo Delgado and 17 in Inhambane Province.

The most common cases of complaints presented to paralegals to date include those associated with perceived unfair compensations in the context of infrastructure.
initiatives associated to the LNG project, conflicts related to land speculation and cases of violence against women / domestic violence.

Trained and active paralegals require further training, technical support and support material. The highly sensitive nature and publicity given to issues occurring in Palma, places paralegals in a rather delicate position.

Experience from other sector programs involving community volunteers indicates that the sustainability of such a network of community paralegals would not only require training and support. Logistical limitations such as distance and the availability of transport has often required the distribution of bicycles. In other sectors, the inclusion of stipends has been required and is likely to be an expectation held by paralegals both at community, district and provincial level. Notwithstanding, it is important that any measure taken is consistent with the approach taken at the national level to avoid unsustainable precedents.

In conclusion, there is no clear-cut strategy guaranteeing the sustainability of paralegal structures. The experience to date in Palma bears witness to this as paralegals received training in the few years prior to CTV engaging in Palma and allegedly ‘made available’ to the District Government, but it was not until CTV became established in the District that the trained paralegals had the opportunity to actually engage in paralegal work as CTV brought logistical and material resources.

In Conclusion

Structures have been created for dialogue and monitoring of different O&G projects at local, provincial and national level. There is not an apparent need for additional structures, but more so to supporting, participating and contributing to collective learning in such initiatives.

Paralegals have been regarded as a potential mechanism to bring the judicial and judiciary closer to the people.

**Recommendations:**

- Training of paralegals needs to include all the same issues proposed for communities, this may imply widening the scope of the training curricula considered to date.

- Like other stakeholders interacting with communities, paralegals need to understand the potential impacts of gender-blind O&G projects on women with the view of promoting women’s effective participation in governance processes and presentation of gender specific grievances.

- Documentation of experiences with paralegals in the context of the project – good and bad – will be extremely valuable in seeking effective solutions to pressing problems.

3.4 Other Key Interventions around Accountability in Extractives

An increasing number of programs are seeking to contribute to the development of capacities among various Government institutions, CSOs, the media and communities in Mozambique, as well as in increasing transparency, accountability and participation. This section refers to other programs identified in the course of the conduction of this baseline. In some instances very similar areas of intervention to what is proposed by the Oxfam program are identified requiring dialogue and decision-making; in others
complementarity of interventions is apparent, inviting to coordination between agencies; lastly, in other cases, the purpose of interventions is so closely related to the aims of the Oxfam project that further enquiry and attentiveness to progress and results achieved seems imperative.

**CCM** – Leader of the Thematic Group of CSOs in Cabo Delgado devoted to Governance issues (in the context of FOCADE). Implements a Governance Program at present in the Districts of Mocimboa da Praia, Montepuez and Metuge creating “Multisector District Governance Platforms” that support District-level planning processes and inclusion of a gender lens. At the District-level these are fed by Technical Committees. These District-level structures in turn liaise and receive information from Community Development Committees (Comités de Desenvolvimento Comunitário). Technical Committees are supported by CCM in line with the sectors supported in certain districts. At present, their focus is placed on combating corruption and increasing service delivery in the education, health and water sector in the three Districts mentioned above. Technical Committees use the citizen scorecard methodology.

New Technical Committees are being supported in the Districts of Palma and Montepuez through a three-year project that started in 2014 in Cabo Delgado Province, with NORAD / Norwegian Church Aid funding; the technical focus in this case is Public Finances and Natural Resources. The objective will be to monitor District financial flows and spending and increase CSO and community advocacy for transparency in the management of natural resources. Norwegian Church Aid funding will also be used to raise awareness of communities in Palma and Montepuez on legislation relevant to the LNG project, human rights and seek to assess the degree to which poverty alleviation can and is achieved in the District.

**CIP** – This Maputo-based organization focuses on the conduction of studies and investigative journalism on issues of public interest with the view of increasing awareness and access to information on transparency and accountability. The organization has become known in Mozambique through its publications and participation on debates on issues such as the analysis of relevant legislative content, funding of presidential campaigns, condemnation of irregularities in electoral processes, criticism of biased financial analysis of O&G projects. The area of expertise of this organization is especially relevant to support critical thinking around issues of interest for the promotion of good governance, transparency and accountability around extractives.10

**FAO** - The Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) has been implementing a capacity building and legal empowerment program working with the CFFJ on the creation of an effective training curriculum for paralegals and key government officials at all levels in

---

Mozambique under the conviction that empowering communities alone is not enough, what is needed is an “empowerment chain” that enables local Government, communities and private investors to work collaboratively towards common development (FAO, 2014).

**ITC** – At the time when the interview with this organization took place in December 2014, it was in the process of finalizing a concept note for a five-year project in Palma. The main areas of intervention contemplated at the time included strengthening the provision of support on associativism, land demarcation, and the establishment of partnerships between communities and private investors.

**IUCN** – Under the Fair Coasts Project, IUCN is currently working on the establishment of a Sustainable Development Forum in Cabo Delgado Province (2015), with a landscape focus on the area between Pemba and the Tanzanian border in the Palma District where indirect and cumulative effects of infrastructural and other activities will be felt. The forum aims to bring together all stakeholders from the province (Government institutions, O&G companies, private sector, CSOs and communities) as well as observers (donors, media, research institutions) in a level-playing field dedicated to dialogue and concerted action to address the impacts of O&G in the target area. IUCN is contemplating the development of a communication strategy involving capacity building and coordination using various media communication tools and creating an open information center in Pemba on O&G with a specific focus on the LNG project (IUCN, 2014).

**UNDP** – Following its Global Initiative and a Regional Project in Africa to support country-level efforts around its Strategy for Supporting Sustainable and Equitable Management of the Extractive Sector for Human Development, UNPD Mozambique figures as one of the target countries. Some of the key areas of intervention in relevant to the Oxfam program are as follows: strengthening the country’s capacity for participatory policy formulation, effective law and policy implementation and intersectorial coordination for the governance of extractives; strengthening the voice, access to information and participation of CSOs and communities on issues related to extractive industries by strengthening the capacity of local Governments to dialogue with CSOs (UNDP, 2012).

**World Bank** – The Mozambique Mining and Gas Technical Assistance Project (MAGTAP) technical assistance loan (2013 – 2020) aims to strengthen the capacity and governance of key institutions to manage the mining and hydrocarbon sector in Mozambique. Of interest in the immediate future is the project’s support to the conceptualization and implementation of MIREM’s Communication Strategy, the creation of capacities for annual technical inspection of natural gas construction projects, fiscal control of gas operations, annual visits to gas production / exploration sites for health, safety and environmental monitoring, preparation and disclosure of the Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment (SESA), and CSO and community based organizations (CBOs) training on transparency monitoring for extractive value chains as part of EITI support to CSOs, (World Bank, 2014).

**Organizations known to be working with communities in Palma District, Cabo Delgado**

- **Muleide** – Dissemination of information at community level on laws promoting and protecting the rights of women
- **UPC** – Has five member associations in the District of Palma. Promotes associativism among smallholder and artisanal fisher folk, awareness of their rights and the improvement of productive activities through collective action.
- **AMA** – Improvement of fishing-based livelihoods and sustainable environmental management.

- **Aga Khan Foundation** – Currently supporting the arts and crafts market in the District. Interested in engaging in the development of the cashew nut value chain (IUCN, 2014).

- **CCM** - Please see details above.
ANNEX 1: BIBLIOGRAPHIC REFERENCES


Chatham House, 2013. Guidelines for Good Governance in Emerging Oil and Gas Producers. The Royal Institute of International Affairs.

CIP, June 2011. EITI Implementation, Natural Resources Management and Urgency of Renegotiations and Publishing the Contracts with Mega-Projects: The Case of Mozambique.


FAO, 2014. When the Law is not Enough: Paralegals and Natural Resource Governance in Mozambique. For the Development Law Service, FAO Legal Office. FAO Legislative Study 110. ISSN 1014-6679.


Harari, N., 2005. Literature Review on the Quirimbas National Park, Northern Mozambique. Centre for Development and Environment; Department of Geography, University of Bern. WS 04/05.


Sekelekani. Policiar o Comunicar com Quitupo: Eis a Questão.


Vieira Mário, T., (a). Já Nenguém Bate Palmas… em Palma.

Vieira Mário, T., (b). Reassentamentos em Palma, Entre Expectativas e Incertezas.


### ANNEX 2: INSTITUTIONS AND PEOPLE INTERVIEWED

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Civil Society Organizations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Oxfam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Oxfam in Mozambique</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sekelekane: Centro de Estudos e Pesquisa de Comunicação</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Centro Terra Viva (CTV)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Forum Mulher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IESE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Women and Law in Southern Africa (WLSA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>National Civil Society Platform on Natural Resources and Extractive industries (PNSCRNIE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conselho Cristão de Moçambique (CCM)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CTV Delegation in Pemba City, Cabo Delgado</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CTV Delegation in Palma District, Cabo Delgado</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ASPALMA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conselho Cristão de Moçambique (CCM)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Iniciativa de Terras Comunitárias (ITC) - Pemba</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>International Union for the Conservation of Nature (IUCN)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Oxfam Solidarité Belgium</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Government Institutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ministry of Mineral Resources (MIREM)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ministry for the Coordination of Environmental Affairs (MICOA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Provincial Directorate for Finances, Planning and Development (DPFPD)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Donors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Norwegian Embassy in Mozambique</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Media</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Radio Moçambique</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jornal Noticias</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Radio Sem Fronteiras</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jornal Horizonte</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ANNEX 3: NON-STATISTICAL QUANTIFIERS

A value scale from 1 to 5 was provided whereby 1 being either the lowest or the least and 5 being the highest or the most. The ‘N’ figure indicates the number of respondents that responded to the particular question.

Outcome 1: Women, youth and men improve skills to influence petroleum governance decision-making and to mitigate consequences of oil and gas industries in their locality.

What is the level of knowledge on land and petroleum legislation among communities directly affected by O&G projects in Inhambane and Cabo Delgado?

What is the level of knowledge on gender impacts of E1 among communities directly affected by O&G projects in Inhambane and Cabo Delgado?

What is the level of participation of men, women and youth in O&G governance processes?

What is the level of participation of communities in O&G research, debate and analysis?

Outcome 2: Civil society organizations and platforms, including women’s rights organizations and media groups, strengthen engagement in economic, environmental, and social oversight and advocacy for improved petroleum revenue management at national and sub-national levels.

How would you rate the level advocacy and negotiation capacities among CSOs at national level?
How would you rate the level **advocacy and negotiation capacities among CSOs at sub-national level**?

![Bar chart with N=6]

What is the level of **knowledge of non-specialized CSOs of the Land Law**?

![Bar chart with N=6]

What is the level of **knowledge of non-specialized CSOs of the Petroleum Law and O&G projects and processes**?

![Bar chart with N=6]

What is the **capacity of the media to report** on O&G issues?

![Bar chart with N=9]

What is the **capacity of the media to engage in constructive debate** on O&G issues?

![Bar chart with N=9]
ANNEX 4: SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

This annex presents summarized information on each of the program indicators for the Mozambique country program, as expressed by interviewees. For further reference, please consult the body of the baseline report.

### OUTCOME 1: Women, youth and men improve skills to influence petroleum governance decision-making and to mitigate consequences of oil and gas industries in their locality.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1.1 Understanding of men, women and youth in directly affected communities of land and petroleum legislation | In directly affected communities in Palma District:  
- Community members (men, women and youth), in rural Mozambique, have minimal knowledge on land law, rated at 2.6 / 5 by interviewees (n=7);  
  71% estimate knowledge to be slightly higher in Palma district though.  
- All those inquired (n=7) stated that knowledge on petroleum legislation and other relevant legislation, the patchy nature of legislation overall, understanding of O&G projects, or distribution of responsibilities is almost inexistent at community level. |
| 1.2 Participation of men, women and youth in decision-making processes around O&G issues at local level                                       | • Inclusive Comité da Comunidade have been created to link communities and other stakeholders in the context of the O&G project in Palma. They have been reported to be functional.  
  • Youth have been reported to be interested and vocal. Women participate but appear to be less expressive than their male partners. |
| 1.3 Effective mechanisms for collective action in place at community level                                                                  | • Mechanisms of collaboration are kin, religion, livelihood or neighborliness based.  
  • Comité da Comunidade established in the context of O&G project constitute a potential mechanism for joint / collective action. |
| 1.4 Effective grievance redress mechanisms in place and use (judicial and extrajudicial)                                                  | • Rural communities have relatively common grievance mechanisms to channel concerns to Government. These are likely used in Palma and other potential target communities.  
  • Anadarko and ENI public documentation indicates the intention of creating formal grievance mechanisms for communities, however it was not possible to confirm if these are operational and effective. |
| 1.5 Community understanding of gender impacts of Extractive Industries (EI)                                                                | • 71% of respondents (n=7) consider that communities are aware of some of the direct impacts – but not all – that O&G can have on their lives, giving the level of awareness a rating below 2.5 / 5.  
  • Specific impacts on women are not consciously understood given or highlighted; this is a reflection of gender power relations and norms. Communities also do not fully understand the potential range of impacts that O&G projects could have on them. |
| 1.6 Barriers to women’s participation on decision-making in O&G processes identified and challenged                                          | • Key barriers identified are: traditional dominance of men in public sphere, lack of experience and lower literacy and schooling.  
  • Participation of women in Palma in Community activities has been regarded as less habitual by men than vice versa. |

[42](#)
Committees (created in the context of the LNG project) does not consistently reach parity, women tend to not be very vocal and mostly support points of view of their male peers.

1.7 Research, analysis and reporting on O&G governance and revenue use at local and sub-national level with consultation / participation of community groups

- Recent studies (published by the time the baseline was conducted) have not focused on local level governance and revenue use.
- Research does not involve community members beyond the role of informants.
- Program partners have published a number of documents outlining their views and experiences but have not been based on internationally renown methods, which could be, seem do compromise their legitimacy.

OUTCOME 2: Civil society organizations and platforms, including women’s rights organizations and media groups, strengthen engagement in economic, environmental, and social oversight and advocacy for improved petroleum revenue management at national and sub-national levels.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 2.1 Need, existence and use of an online platform for O&G | • The need for a repository dedicated to O&G was expressed by virtually all stakeholders.  
• A public online platform dedicated to O&G does not exist as of yet, but IUCN is already engaged in a project aiming to create one.  
• The Ministry of Mineral Resources will be launching a communication strategy for O&G, probably in 2015.  |
| 2.2 Advocacy and negotiation skills among SCOs, NGOs and the media | • Specialized CSOs are seen as having full command of the Land Law (rated 5 / 5); The rating was lower for non-specialized CSOs (rated at 2 / 5 (n=6)). Knowledge of other laws and processes associated with O&G were rated at 1.75 by 83% of interviewees (n=6).  
• Efforts to date – and capacities – are much higher among specialized SCOs at national level (rated at 3 / 5 (n=6)) where most strategic decisions are made given that O&G projects in target geographic areas are in non-operational stage. A rating of 1.5 was given by the same interviewees to CSOs at sub-national level.  
• Only one media channel in Cabo Delgado Province (Jornal Horizonte) was found to be part of a network (FOCADE) of organizations that could potentially be involved in O&G advocacy activities at sub-national level.  |
| 2.3 Barriers to women’s participation on decision-making in O&G processes identified and challenged | • In general terms, CSOs understand these barriers but do not yet have a clear agenda to contribute to overcoming these in the context of O&G projects.  
• Partners have a good level of knowledge of gender concepts and are in the process of developing organizational level gender strategies. Efforts in increasing capacities around O&G gender programming should be given special attention.  |
| 2.4 Laws protecting the interests and rights of women understood | • Laws providing specific protection to women are understood by organizations fighting for women’s rights and likely to be the case among members of the Gender Thematic Group in the Provincial |
Civil Society Platform FOCADE (Cabo Delgado)
- This is however not enough; knowledge needs to be strengthened among CSOs on the (i) pervasive inequalities of gender power relations; (ii) common areas of inequality between men and women; (iii) the specific common effects of EI projects on women for effective gender sensitive O&G programing.

2.5 O&G revenue management is gender sensitive and pro-poor
- Aligned donors have played a strong role in influencing pro-poor development due to the weight of their contribution in policy development and financial contribution. Changes could be seen in their level of influence in the future with new income streams.
- O&G revenue management is very new and needs to be more openly accounted for, including Government accountability of O&G funds that are received by State institutions beyond the Treasury.

2.6 PSCNRNIE has strategic and investment plans, advocacy agenda for engagement with Government and O&G companies
- Advocacy and communication strategies were being produced at the time of this study, which will clarify the specific geographic target areas for joint engagement.
- Members recognize the need to include members and their constituencies in their work.

2.7 PSCNRNIE National and sub-national advocacy and campaigns supported
- The PNSCRNIE has funding from WWF until mid 2015 but will need to fundraise for national and sub-national level advocacy campaigns.

2.8 Capacity of media based partners around O&G issues
- The media in Mozambique faces:
  - Lack of resources to reach isolated communities was identified by all respondents as a major factor (n=9),
  - Historical and political factors limiting its ability to engage in critical and educational journalism in virtually every sector were identified as having even more influence in the ability to report on O&G among three of these respondents (n=9),
  - Lack of understanding of highly technical and complex O&G issues
  - Tendency towards self-censorship

2.9 Interactive radio and TV debates on EI policies, engage power holders, elected representatives and the public
- It is estimated that 12 television & radio debates took place in the 12 months preceding the baseline survey.
- Quality of the debates was rated at an average of 1.75 / 5 (n=9).
- Public debate is constrained by the structural limitations of journalism in Mozambique.

2.10 Media elevates the national and international profile of key platform members as spokespersons for transparency and good governance
- Spokespersons on good governance, accountability and transparency are not highlighted in the media for the reasons explained above.

**OUTCOME 3: Governments and private sector in the petroleum industry become increasingly receptive and responsive to the demands of active citizens, civil society, and media and their responsibility to operate transparently and accountably as duty-bearers.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Existence of a formal</td>
<td>Mechanism already exist, including:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>effective mechanism of dialogue to monitor commitments, contract compliance and legislation on community rights</td>
<td>Mozambican EITI - PNSCRNIE - Cabo Delgado Sustainable Development Forum - Community Committees in Palma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 3.2 Paralegals in Cabo Delgado and Inhambane provide quality services to directly affected communities | • Paralegals exist in Cabo Delgado and Palma and received trained based on the CTJJ curriculum and others. However training needs faced continue to be important.  
• 10 paralegals were reported to be active and intending to join the upcoming ASPALMA (Association of Paralegals of the District of Palma).  
• Paralegals do not have support material beyond the material produced by CTV.  
• CTV has already trained three community level paralegals. |
FROM: CEIDA – CSR in Extractive Industries in Developing Areas
TO: Chiqui Arregui, Social Development Consultant

Topic: Independent Review Report

on the MOZAMBIQUE Baseline Study around “Accountability through Active Citizenship: Improving Petroleum Governance in Ghana, Mozambique and Tanzania” conducted by the Social Development Consultant Chiqui Arregui.

To Chiqui Arregui,

According to our engagement letter, we have reviewed the non-quantitative information contained in:

the Draft Mozambique Baseline Survey Report, (hereinafter “the Report”) prepared by Chiqui Arregui (hereinafter “the Consultant”), an assignment of Oxfam America in December 2014. The information reviewed corresponds to:

• the indicators referred to in the log frame section and original terms of references
• the coherence of the Mozambique report with those of the other two countries

The consultant is responsible for the preparation and presentation of the Report in time for CEIDA members to review, to organize the CEIDA internal debate and to respond to questions raised during the debate and by e-mail. Our responsibility is to carry out a review engagement designed to provide a reasonable level of assurance and express a conclusion based on the work done, referred exclusively to the information corresponding to the Report. We have also made comments and suggestions on the draft of the report, for inclusion in the version to be submitted to Oxfam. Our contribution is pro bono, and CEIDA members involved in the process have developed their activity individually.

It is recommended that Oxfam proceeds with the program and uses the report, as amended, as a benchmark for program implementation. Oxfam should also take account of the various contextual aspects mentioned in the Report that the project will not be able to address within its lifetime, including the structural causes for gender inequality, the country’s high youth rate and the space available to CSO participation in governance issues. As such, the program should look at more concrete and measurable targets, and identify concrete interventions to include these issues in the country program.

Prof. Josep Maria, chairman

Barcelona, 29 January 2015
Forty percent of the people on our planet—more than 2.5 billion—now live in poverty, struggling to survive on less than $2 a day. Oxfam America is an international relief and development organization working to change that. Together with individuals and local groups in more than 90 countries, Oxfam saves lives, helps people overcome poverty, and fights for social justice. To join our efforts or learn more, go to www.oxfamamerica.org.