ACCOUNTABILITY THROUGH ACTIVE CITIZENSHIP: IMPROVING PETROLEUM GOVERNANCE IN GHANA, MOZAMBIQUE & TANZANIA

MID-TERM ASSESSMENT REPORT – OVERALL BRIEF

Chiqui Arregui
Katinka C. van Cranenburgh

March 2016
As part of our commitment to accountability and learning, Oxfam will share conclusions and recommendations from mid-term assessment reports. Internally we will share with relevant stakeholders, ensuring that they have an opportunity to participate in discussion of those results in meaningful ways. We will also publish the evaluation reports on our website in accessible language.

As a rights-based organization, accountability, particularly to the communities we seek to serve, is of the highest importance to us. For Oxfam, accountability requires Oxfam to regularly and honestly assess the quality of its work, share and learn from its findings with primary stakeholders, and apply that learning in future work.

This is a Mid-Term Assessment for Oxfam America’s Program Accountability through Active Citizenship: Improving Petroleum Governance in Ghana, Mozambique and Tanzania. The program has been operating in Ghana, Mozambique and Tanzania since July 2014.

The major activities for producing this report took place in January and February 2016. The study was carried out by Chiqui Arregui and Katinka van Cranenburgh through a competitive process and reflects the findings as reported by them as validated with stakeholders. The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed in this report are entirely those of the author(s) and should not be attributed to Oxfam America Inc. or its affiliated organizations, or its members of its Board of Executive Directors or the countries they represent.

The assessment was managed by Julie Kim, Program Officer from Oxfam America, and commissioned by Keith Slack, Extractive Industries Global Program Manager, Programs Department.

For additional information regarding the study Terms of Reference, please refer to the report appendices.
CONTENTS

1. PROJECT AND MID-TERM ASSESSMENT OBJECTIVES .......................... 4
2. TARGET-COUNTRY CONTEXT .................................................................. 4
3. METHODOLOGY ................................................................................. 5
4. MID-TERM ASSESSMENT FINDINGS .................................................. 6
   4.1 Ghana ................................................................................................. 6
   4.2 Mozambique ...................................................................................... 7
   4.3 Tanzania ............................................................................................. 8
   4.4 Program Management ........................................................................ 9
5. CONCLUDING REMARKS ................................................................. 10
ANNEX 1: TERMS OF REFERENCE ....................................................... 11
Note: This report summarizes three separate country reports produced for the Mid-Term Assessment in Accountability and Active Citizenship Program in Extractives in Ghana, Mozambique and Tanzania. Full details are to be found in those individual country reports.

1. PROJECT AND MID-TERM ASSESSMENT OBJECTIVES

The NORAD-funded Accountability through Active Citizenship: Improving Petroleum Governance in Ghana, Mozambique and Tanzania program aims to support active and informed community participation, civil society’s active engagement and increased and better quality media reporting on oil and gas (O&G) governance issues and processes. In doing so, the program seeks to contribute to the development of a vibrant and transparent O&G sector.

The objective of the Mid-Term Assessment (MTA) is to analyze and document (i) progress in the implementation of activities; (ii) results achieved; (iii) changes in the context that could affect the program; (iv) assess program management practices and (v) put forth recommendations to maximize the achievement of results in the last months of operations before the end of the program in December 2016.

2. TARGET-COUNTRY CONTEXT

Increased supply of crude oil in international markets and other factors have contributed to the continued drop in oil prices in 2015. The effects of this shift in the market could compromise the growth and development of the O&G sector in Ghana, Mozambique and Tanzania and negatively affect social and environmental performance if operators abiding to lower standards get involved in the sector. This could lead to lower-than-expected government revenue from the O&G sector that could affect development in each of these countries and render them more aid-dependent than initially anticipated in coming decades.

Regional interests over newly discovered gas deposits and gas produced in Mozambique and Tanzania persist; and the East Africa region has the potential to become the world’s new O&G hub. New pipelines are being approved and others being anticipated with the aim to increasing current market volumes and efficiency.

Mozambique and Tanzania struggle to find a slot in the international Liquefied Natural Gas (LNG) market, while their governments work on setting up the institutional, legal and regulatory frameworks.

Challenges are not only being felt by governments and the private sector. Donor funding for CSOs overall saw a continued downward trend in 2015 as northern hemisphere countries struggle with lagging economic crises and new humanitarian challenges. CSO competition over increasingly scarce resources is growing with the potential of eroding space for collaboration.
Despite being in different stages of O&G development, accountability and transparency of processes and results are needed in all three countries.

- **Ghana**: Despite the absence of a modernized Exploration and Production (E&P) Bill, the contracting of companies by governments to explore and produce O&G continues causing frustration among civil society and the media. The upcoming national elections (planned for November 2016) might further delay the process. Increased knowledge transfer has developed CSOs and media potential to constructively debate O&G issues and improve transparency. Increased knowledge has improved the potential of CSOs and the media to constructively debate O&G issues and improve transparency. However, this has not (yet) led to the desired reduction of discretionary powers and corruption at government level.

- **Mozambique**: The long awaited announcement of the Final Investment Decision (FID) for the LNG project in Palma is expected in the first half of 2016. Over the past year, the focus in Palma has been on the production of the resettlement plan and associated processes. The construction of a second pipeline to enhance SASOL’s gas development operations in southern Mozambique was recently announced. Likewise, exploration activities will take off soon in new O&G blocks along the coast.

- **Tanzania**: A new government took power in 2015 after probably the most competitive elections in Tanzania’s democratic history. Against this setting, the government tabled sector bills under Certificate of Emergency and without consultation. The country faces fierce competition to get into the earliest available LNG market slots in 2025 – according to a key interviewee there is a 50-50 chance of that happening. However, with substantial delays, the site for the LNG plant was finally announced in late 2015. On another front, the construction of a new 500+ km pipeline between Mtwara and Dar es Salaam revamped the capacity of existing on-shore O&G projects.

### 3. METHODOLOGY

The MTA was implemented in three discrete phases: (i) inception; (ii) data collection; and (iii) analysis and production of deliverables.

The MTA was based on a qualitative approach, which included a thorough literature review encompassing partner reports, publications, media clippings and in-country news, and interviews. A total of total of 86 interviewees were reached across the three countries; one focus group discussion was also conducted in Ghana.

Women represented well below 40% of the interviewees reached, reflecting the predominance of male participation among stakeholders working on O&G issues in the three countries.

The same set of non-statistical quantifiable indicators used in the baseline survey was used among MTA interviewees. While only a minority of those exposed to these
indicators were repeat respondents¹, a longitudinal perspective was integrated by asking first-time interviewees to describe if the ratings attributed to their responses represented an increase, decrease or stability of the situations assessed.

It was not possible to interview a number of key interviewees in each of the countries, which could result in data gaps and limit the comprehensiveness of findings.

4. MID-TERM ASSESSMENT FINDINGS

This section presents summarized findings for each country targeted by the program.

Progress in the implementation of planned activities is mixed across the 3 countries. The program has correctly adopted a non-interventionist and process oriented approach sensitive to each of the contexts; this means that at times not intervening or doing less than initially anticipated is in fact, the right thing to do. Only a few instances of less-justified limited intervention were identified.

The program shows positive results overall with pronounced developments in strengthening the capacity and role of the media in Ghana and Mozambique. In Tanzania progress is seen among a wider range of stakeholders including community level animators and CSOs, together with significant progress in setting the foundations for the development of a gender in extractives agenda in the country and in supporting the consolidation of a platform dedicated to the governance of extractive industries.

Performance in this context is thus not exclusively measured in terms of level of accomplishment of plans, but also and more importantly on the quality of the processes used to make progress towards intended results in each country. This section presents summarized findings for each country targeted by the program.

4.1 Ghana

With regards to knowledge development and distribution around transparency and accountability in the O&G revenue management the quality of research available is growing mainly due to the efforts of the Oxfam partner Africa Centre for Energy Policy (ACEP). Additionally, long-term Oxfam partner, Centre for Public Interest Law (CEPIL), has increased distribution of research and case studies related to community impacts and community rights.

The general increase of research available on O&G revenue management has ensured a level playing field whereby all relevant actors (government, civil society, men and women in communities and the private sector) dialogue on the basis of fairly equal access to information. However, no improvement in research around O&G contract implementation was made due to the low availability of contracts.

Increasingly, women participate in research dissemination events and some Oxfam-supported research is focused on sectors impacted by O&G in which women are strongly represented such as rice farming and irrigation.

With regards to the role of the media in informing citizens and community members about governmental petroleum revenue capture and management, substantial efforts are underway. ACEP plays an important role in training and coaching journalists to ensure reporting meets high-quality standards. Follow-up support of

¹ Repeat respondent refers to person(s) having rated an indicator both in the program’s baseline survey as well as in the MTA.
journalists and media houses is required as to ensure the journalists can put their learning into practice.

Stakeholders continue to feel that the use of technology/online platform to share, aggregate and make quality information readily available is still of great relevance. The baseline study recommended alignment with existing on-line platforms around content, target groups and management. Whilst the platforms are used intensively, alignment is still lacking. The NORAD funded www.oilmoneyTV.org is to be officially launched in March 2016 and will contribute towards such efforts.

Progress in strengthening the legal framework against corruption still needs to be made. Hardly any improvements could be made in 2015 as a key piece, the draft E&P Bill, has still not been approved by the government and awaits final governmental decision. Therefore, discretionary powers of government officials remain high and hardly any monitoring or accountability structures are in place. Oxfam program partners made formal recommendations to improve the legal framework in the following areas: (1) prevention of the use of oil reserves as collateral for loans and (2) instating a ceiling of <75% to withdrawals from the stabilization fund.

With regards to government understanding and monitoring of the legal framework governing the O&G sector, relevant government committees have a reasonable level of understanding of O&G regulations but lack the authority and independence to follow-up on their actions. The citizens' representatives' organization, the Public Interest and Accountability Committee, is facing high turn-over of members but has improved its status amongst stakeholders and increased its capacity and independence now that it is no longer solely funded by the institution it is supposed to monitor, the government. Despite EITI compliance, contract development and contract signing is still not transparent in Ghana, although informally some oil contracts are reviewed by ACEP before signing.

4.2 Mozambique

Interviewees reached are of the opinion that awareness of sector laws and processes among communities affected by O&G projects has increased in 2015, due to the combined effects of program and other interventions. According to interviewees, an area which has not seen practically any changes is women’s participation in governance processes.

The Oxfam partnership with Centro Terra Viva (CTV) unexpectedly came to an end in 2015. A new partnership will be forged between Oxfam and the Conselho Cristão de Moçambique (CCM) in Cabo Delgado to consolidate the capacity of community paralegals in Palma that can serve as focal points for information and advice. The upcoming partnership will leverage on on-going interventions by CCM in that district around gender sensitive district planning with a focus on public finances and natural resources.

The program supported training activities at national and provincial level to increase CSOs and media capacity – all considered of relevance and effective by interviewees. The program also linked partners with emerging capacity building opportunities in the region and internationally. While highly positive, training interventions appear to have been identified on an ad hoc basis rather than as part of a capacity building plan jointly agreed upon by the program and key stakeholders – this is especially the case with trainings targeting CSOs.

Knowledge and coordination gaps persist within the civil society sector. Linkages between national, provincial and district platforms also need to be strengthened.
The program has provided *ad hoc* support to the national civil society platform on extractives in Mozambique (*PNSCRNIE*). The program is well placed to increase dialogue and use the remaining months of the program to strategically support member organizations in finding strategies that render the platform more effective.

In addition to training, a program partner, Sekelekani, is using creative on-the-job capacity building approach, namely, a journalism competition among a core group of journalists, which is expected to bear fruit in 2016. Interviewees expressed that the **quantity and quality of debates on O&G issues in the media** have increased in the last 12 months. The emergence of four respected CSO spokespersons was identified by interviewees as of high significance. Civilinfo, a civil society news agency, was launched in 2015 with program support. The platform’s existence and usefulness needs to be further disseminated among CSOs in the country though – not all CSOs interviewed in the context of the MTA knew of its existence.

The number of research-related targets set by the program appears to be too high considering program duration. Potential topics for studies are in the process of being explored; it appears that a more inclusive approach to defining research topics could be more effective for instilling ownership among Mozambican stakeholders and increase use and impact. The program has supported the production and dissemination of research publications by its partner Sekelekani and will continue to do so in the last year of operations.

Limited contacts were made by Oxfam with organizations carrying out research around **gender and extractives** in 2015. At least 2 organizations in the country have already integrated a gender in extractives focus in their internal agendas or strategic plan. These two organizations constitute potential entry points for Oxfam. The program could use its convening power, along with its expertise in women’s rights and extractives and existing linkages in the region with specialized organizations to contribute towards the development of an agenda around gender and extractives.

### 4.3 Tanzania

In 2015, the program in Tanzania established partnerships with two organizations: Faidika Wote Pamoja Tanzania (FAWOPA) in Mtwara Region and the Lindi Region Association of Non-Governmental Organizations (LANGO). The program also continued collaborating with several national level CSOs working on governance in extractives and gender issues.

**Pronounced developments have been seen as a result of the training opportunities provided by the program.** In fact, much was achieved in this respect in the last 12 months of operations. Interviewees expressed that the Oxfam program did in fact partly contribute to improving community awareness and capacity around O&G issues. Animators were trained together with village and ward community representatives. The program plans to continue this process until the end of the grant. This is regarded as beneficial, but should also integrate new pressing issues, such as explaining the uncertain future of the LNG project in Tanzania, O&G project stages, resettlement and compensation standards and practices, among others. During the MTA animators expressed the need for comprehensive but easy to understand support material covering all the technical issues included in the capacity building plan. This request should be considered by the program.

The **knowledge base and capacity of CSOs around O&G issues** is said to have increased as a result of program interventions. Some – but positive - progress was made in targeting media houses and journalists where it is most relevant, namely in Mtwara, the southern Tanzania region where most CSOs are based.
Capacities need to be consolidated in 2016 though. It seems that a focus on a limited number of journalists would be more effective for longer-term results than the approach used to date in which different journalists were invited to different trainings on O&G issues. Program efforts align well with investments being made by other organizations to build the capacity of the media at national level.

Interviewees expressed the quality of debates on O&G issues has increased slightly in the last year, although not attributable to program interventions alone. Journalists are starting to touch on the topic again after a period of silence following the 2013 unrest in Mtwara.

The national level platform HakiRasilimali is recognized as a critical and well-informed contributor to national policy debates on O&G. The program is and will continue supporting the process of institutional / organizational development to increase the platform’s potential and medium to long-term effectiveness. At the same time, the program aims to provide necessary technical support required by the platform in the last months of operations. Issues considered of special interest at present are full contract disclosure and the development of a transparency agenda by T-EITI. The general approach adopted by the program to support the platform is considered as adequate by the MTA.

### 4.4 Program Management

Oxfam has invested substantial efforts in strengthening program staff capacity to ensure strong technical performance. Inputs appear to both respond to existing needs and to have adequately equipped staff to gauge and take opportunities as they arise. Opportunities have also been explored and are planned to expose CSO partners to international short-term training opportunities. The value of offering these opportunities to local CSO partners should be underscored. Participation in technical events in the region is as important as participation in formal training sessions.

The only clear missed opportunity identified related to systematic sharing of experience between program countries and joint strategic planning. Contacts are ad hoc and successful experiences from a given country have not seem to have inspired strategy development in other target countries. The same gap was actually identified at the level of in-country program management: a partner-by-partner and component-by-component approach dominates the overall program management style. Program strategies appear to be largely disconnected, despite the fact that all interventions; capacity building, research and advocacy activities, are all interlinked. This could be one of the reasons explaining why the program has not contributed to the adoption by CSOs of proactive stances in these domains.

The consultants observed that the program is driven by ambitious but meaningful high-level goals and sensitivity to local contexts has been adopted. However, when activities are implemented more attention is placed on the inputs and less on the results obtained from each activity. If not redressed, this could constitute an important constrain in linking activities to outcomes.

A complex monitoring framework has been used and adapted by the program as needed. At present program staff should only consider adapting activity and output level information. However, it became apparent to the consultants that the framework is not consistently understood by in-country staff and partners. A simpler logic should guide the organization of this kind of document in the future. More, design should explore the linkages between activities, outputs and the contribution to outcomes in further detail to ascertain that all relevant areas of intervention are reflected in program strategies and operational plans.
The program faced encountered delays in the receipt of funds from NORAD slightly affected program operations. An estimated 10% reduction on the initial budget was caused by currency fluctuation and reduced availability of funding. However, Oxfam reports that negative effects were not produced given gross under spending in year one as a result of grant related documents having been signed later than expected. Information obtained in the MTA indicates that Mozambique and Tanzania faced challenges associated with the recruitment of key staff and/or the identification of key program partners.

5. CONCLUDING REMARKS

The Oxfam program has made inspiring progress in adapting to the process of development of the O&G sector in each of the countries. Abiding strictly to work plans would have, in effect, been detrimental for program short and long-term effects. With only a few months left, the program will need to achieve specific results. More than focusing on numbers (number of position papers, number of trainings, number of people trained, et cetera), which are beneficial only as output indicators, the program should focus on the concrete capacities and results it wants to see in place by the end of operations. Key areas in which the program does have the ability to produce tangible, concrete results being as follows:

- Increasing the capacity of animators / paralegals in core, previously defined, currently relevant topics
- Setting up adequate support systems between community level trained players and “expert” organizations
- Consolidating the capacities of a core set of journalists interested in extractives and establishment of linkages with specialized organizations (CSOs, universities, etc.)
- Promoting alignment between different online initiatives
- Supporting the development of scientific research capacities among partners to move from anecdotal evidence to documented facts, based on needs identified by partners and collaborators, which align to other program interventions
- Using convening power to engage in a process whereby in each country, the program brings together partners and collaborators, and other prominent thinkers to jointly analyze the status, opportunities and challenges associated with the state of development of the O&G sector in their country. Use this opportunity to help CSOs and other players adopt a proactive (rather than solely reactive) approach to advocacy, research, reflection, discussion and service delivery. Use this opportunity to increase (as relevant) the coherence of the program’s service delivery-evidence-documentation-advocacy platform in each country.
- Supporting the implementation of priority issues identified in each of these areas.
- Continuing to stimulate cross-country learning. For example, the approach used by the program in Tanzania of training a local CSO to train others on gender and extractives is sound and could easily be replicated, as was bringing in specialized organizations in the region on gender and extractives (WoMIN, an African Gender in Extractives Alliance based in South Africa) to consolidate capacities in Tanzania around this topic and create longer term regional / international linkages to support agenda generation in the future.
Project management should be supported by increasing structure and planning and ensuring that partners report in a specific, measurable, attainable, realistic and time-bound manner.

Using Oxfam's role and value, although intangible, in connecting local, regional and global constituencies should not be underestimated.

The consultants suggest that a 3-month extension be requested by Oxfam to ensure that sufficient time is available to effectively meet desired results in Mozambique and Tanzania.

ANNEX 1: TERMS OF REFERENCE

Oxfam Accountability through Active Citizenship: Improving Petroleum Governance in Ghana, Mozambique and Tanzania

Mid-term Assessment Request for Proposals

I. Background

Oxfam has been awarded a 30-month grant for a project designed to promote economically, environmentally and socially responsible management of gas/petroleum resources in Ghana, Mozambique and Tanzania. This project is central to Oxfam’s mission to reduce poverty and empower poor people to take action on their own behalf.

Oxfam America is one of 17 affiliates in the international confederation, Oxfam International. The Active Citizenship grant involves three affiliates in a confederation-wide effort to engage in specific, coordinated actions at the local and national level.

A mid-term assessment will be conducted in September/October 2015 in Ghana, Tanzania and Mozambique. A baseline study was already conducted. This mid-term assessment will utilize the baseline methodology to conduct the assessment. Program activities began in July 2014 and will close December 2016.

II. Purpose and Audience

Purpose: The mid-term assessment will compare the current state of the program against baseline values.

Audiences: The audience is primarily the Oxfam staff and partners working on petroleum and gas governance issues within this grant. The mid-term assessment should help inform ongoing strategy to increase the effectiveness of community training and policy influencing efforts. The mid-term assessment will be shared with Oxfam’s donor in annual reports.

III. Scope and Objectives

This mid-term assessment is meant to evaluate the current state of civil society and target government agencies to promote economically, environmentally and socially responsible management of petroleum resources in Ghana, Mozambique and Tanzania against baseline values determined in 2014.
Outcome 1: Women, men and youth improve skills to influence petroleum governance decision-making and to mitigate consequences of oil and gas industries in their locality.

Outcome Indicator 1.1: Change in women’s, men’s and youth’s skill level for advocacy
Outcome Indicator 1.2: # of localities where community members/leaders are engaging with decision-makers on petroleum governance, each year (or in the past year)

Outcome 2: Civil society organizations and platforms, including women’s rights organizations and media groups, strengthen engagement in economic, environmental, and social oversight and advocacy for improved petroleum revenue management at national and sub-national levels.

Outcome Indicator 2.1: Increase in the number of times CSO’s and platforms engage in oversight and advocacy with relevant bodies at national and sub-national levels to improve petroleum revenue management
Outcome Indicator 2.2: # of press releases, press events, publications and media articles in target countries produced by civil society organizations and platforms encouraging improved petroleum revenue management

Outcome 3: Governments and private sector in the petroleum industry become increasingly receptive and responsive to the demands of active citizens, civil society, and media and their responsibility to operate transparently and accountably as duty-bearers.

Outcome Indicator 3.1: New anti-corruption and transparency clauses and provisions are introduced in legislation of 1-2 target countries by 2016.
Outcome Indicator 3.2: One multi-stakeholder dialogue per year is facilitated in each country starting in 2015.
Outcome Indicator 3.3: # of petroleum governance bodies that make investment information at the project level publically available

IV. Process

The consultant will work with the Oxfam America Program Officer and a monitoring, evaluation and learning (MEL) staff member to agree on a final methodology within the budget constraints provided, finalize the set of key informants and stakeholders to interview and/or survey, the questionnaire or survey instrument questions, as appropriate, and to ensure the evaluation team has adequate access to relevant campaign documentation.

The consultant will then carry out the mid-term assessment, presenting early findings, and draft a final report to the Program Officer and MEL staff member, on a schedule to be agreed, for review and deliberation. This iterative review of preliminary and draft findings is intended to ensure that the final baseline fully meets the needs of the campaign leads and their teams, and that any methodological adjustments that may be warranted are identified early on in the data collection process.

The final mid-term assessment will be delivered after the draft findings have been reviewed and commented on, responding to any remaining questions or data analysis needs identified, and that can be accommodated within the established timeframes and budget.

Periodic project management meetings with the Program Officer will be held, as appropriate.
V. Timeline

June 2015          Select Consultant(s)
November 2015      Finalize methodological approach; sign MOU based on agreed scope, approach and schedule
December 2015      Oxfam field staff work with consultants to identify key informants, review any questionnaire &/or survey instruments & provide relevant campaign documentation
January 2016       Consultant/evaluator completes field research and data collection, reviews documentation
Jan/Febr 2016      Consultant presents preliminary findings to Oxfam staff
March 2016         Consultant prepares draft report, responding to feedback from Oxfam staff, Consultant presents final report, Oxfam staff accept report, after any necessary revisions

VI. Profile of the ideal evaluator

1. Experience conducting prospective, baseline evaluations of complex social and political change processes, ideally in the extractives sector with a gender lens
2. Very strong qualitative analysis skills, particularly with analysis of textual sources and public statements (documents, media coverage interviews, speeches, testimony, etc.)
3. Strong quantitative analysis, particularly in media, including ability to examine multiple national contexts
4. Experience either working on or managing an NGO-led campaign – with a particular focus on public policy around poverty alleviation
5. Experience in Ghana, Tanzania or Mozambique (Portuguese proficiency is required for the Mozambique consultant)
6. Excellent analytical, writing and synthesis skills

VII. Proposal Submission, Review and Interviews

1. Please send a 3-4 page expression of interest with a brief description of the proposed approach by June 20, 2015 to kstanley@oxfamamerica.org
2. We will contact applicants and arrange for phone interviews
3. Final selection will happen by end of July 2015
Forty percent of the people on our planet—more than 2.5 billion—now live in poverty, struggling to survive on less than $2 a day. Oxfam America is an international relief and development organization working to change that. Together with individuals and local groups in more than 90 countries, Oxfam saves lives, helps people overcome poverty, and fights for social justice.

To join our efforts or learn more, go to www.oxfamamerica.org.